

FINAL EVALUATION OF THE PROJECT

**“ENHANCING WOMEN’S PARTICIPATION IN BOTH URBAN AND RURAL LEVEL
DECISION MAKING AT ALL LEVELS OF SOCIETY IN TOGDHEER REGION,
SOMALILAND”**

**COORDINATED BY NAGAAD NETWORK AND FUNDED BY INTERNATIONAL
SOLIDARITY FOUNDATION**

BY OKUMBA MIRUKA

BOX 21547, NAIROBI 00505

TEL: +254-722-809094

Email: okumbamiruka@hotmail.com

November 3, 2012

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	4
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	5
1.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION	16
2.0 METHODOLOGY	20
2.1 Schedule	20
2.2 Data Types and Sources	20
2.3 Respondents	23
2.4 Data Collection Instruments	23
2.5 Data Analysis and Reporting	23
2.6 Challenges Faced	24
3.0 FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION	25
3.1 Project Goal	25
3.2 Project Purpose	29
3.3 Project Results	36
3.4 External and Organisational Environment	53
3.4.1 External Facilitating Factors	53
3.4.2 External Constraining Factors	54
3.4.3 Nagaad's Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities and Threats	57
3.5 Project Relevance	57
3.6 Project Efficiency	62
3.7 Sustainability of Impacts	66
3.8 Capacity Building	73
3.9 Previous Evaluation	74
3.10 Lessons	76
4.0 Conclusions	80
4.1 Project Goal	80
4.2 Project Purpose	81
4.3 Project Results	82
4.4 External Environment	84
4.5 Relevance	84
4.6 Efficiency	84
4.7 Sustainability	84
4.8 Capacity Building	84
4.9 Lessons	85
4.10 Previous Evaluation	85
5.0 RECOMMENDATIONS	86
APPENDIX	90

List of Tables

Table 1: Formative Project Activities	17
Table 2: Respondent Selection Criteria	20
Table 3: List of Respondents by Category	23
Table 4: Representation of Women in Political Party Structures 2009 & 2012	26
Table 5: Representation of Women in the Public Service 2009	28
Table 6: Representation of Women in Top NGO Positions 2009	28
Table 7: Women's Representation in Leadership in Village Structures 2009 & 2012	29
Table 8: Reasons for Supporting Girls' Education	40
Table 9: Elders' Reasons for Supporting Women's Rights	45
Table 10: Effect of Short Courses on Beneficiaries' Vocations	46
Table 11: Actions by Beneficiaries of Short Courses to Support Women's Participation	47
Table 12: Summary of Key Activities and Results 2009-2011	51
Table 13: Nagaad SWOT	57
Table 14: Beneficiaries' List of Needs Addressed	59
Table 15: Project Strengths and Weaknesses	61

ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS:	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
CEC:	Community Education Committee
DAWO:	Development Organisation for Women
FGD:	Focus Group Discussion
HIV:	Human Immuno-deficiency Virus
IDP:	Internally Displaced Person
ISF:	International Solidarity Foundation
LNGO:	Local Non-governmental Organisation
MOE:	Ministry of Education
NFE:	Non Formal Education
SOLCO:	Somaliland Children's Organisation
SOYDAVO:	Somaliland Youth Development Organization
SOYVO:	Somaliland Youth and Voluntary Organisation
SYS:	Somaliland Youth Society
TOR:	Terms of Reference
TOT:	Training of Trainers
TWA:	Togdheer Women's Association
VDC:	Village Development Committee
WDM:	Women in Decision Making
WFP:	World Food Programme

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Overview

This is the report of the final evaluation of the project “Enhancing Women’s Participation in Both Urban and Rural Level Decision Making at all Levels of Society in Togdheer Region”. The evaluation was meant to:

- 1 Analyse the impacts, sustainability, relevance and efficiency of the project with reference to project activities and strategies, and the achievement of the project results, purpose and goal.
- 2 Reflect the situation of end of 2012 to the situation in 2009 and reflect upon the project’s achievements in the light of the previous project evaluation.

The findings would be used in planning the Gender Equality Programme for the International Solidarity Foundation (ISF) in Somaliland.

The goal of the project was “enhancing gender equality in decision making in Togdheer Region”. The purpose was “increased community acceptance of importance of women in decision-making at all levels of Togdheer Region”. Targeted beneficiaries included co-implementers, local non-governmental organisations (LNGOs), government ministries, media houses, female political aspirants, local authorities, university students, clan elders, religious leaders and community education committees (CECs). The project was focused on grassroots empowerment through delivery of Non Formal Education (NFE), outreach awareness raising, dialogue forums and creation of advocacy and lobbying platforms to stimulate institutional change. Togdheer was identified by the Ministry of Planning as one of three Eastern regions that remain under-developed (others are Sanaag and Sool). Togdheer also hosts Nagaad’s regional office in Burao and thus provides a link with other ISF-supported projects. The overall coordination of the project remained with the Hargeisa office at Nagaad Network Headquarters.

ISF provided funding and participated in planning, communication, information sharing, and monitoring and evaluation. Nagaad participated in planning, budgeting, coordination, awareness creation, supervision, monitoring, financial control and quarterly and annual reporting. The project was implemented by six LNGOs and two umbrella organisations¹. The LNGOs focused on the literacy component while the umbrella organisations dealt with awareness creation and advocacy on women’s rights.

The final evaluation was conducted between September 29 and October 9, 2012. The field work was carried out from October 3 to 9, 2012. The informants were: ISF Coordinator in Somaliland, Nagaad project staff, Nagaad management, implementing agency staff, an official of the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, staff of regional NGOs, female and male beneficiaries in urban and rural areas (literacy students, participants in short courses, religious

¹ The six LNGOs were Development Organisation for Women (DAWO), Somaliland Children’s Organisation (SOLCO), Somaliland Youth Development Organization (SOYDAVO), Somaliland Youth and Voluntary Organisation (SOYVO), Somaliland Youth Society (SYS) and Togdheer Women’s Association (TWA) while the umbrella organisations were KULMIS and United Trust Association (UNITA).

leaders and local elders). There were 122 respondents (55 female, 68 male). The evaluation used focus group discussions, key informant interviews, mail questionnaires and observation of project sites and beneficiaries. Findings have been analysed in line with the project logical framework and baseline.

Findings and Conclusions

a) Project Goal

There are 26 women candidates in Togdheer Region contesting in the November 2012 local government elections. In 2002, no woman from the region contested in the elections. The contestants form part of the 142 (6%) women out of 2,368 contestants nationwide. Many of the candidates have been participants in Nagaad workshops and project literacy students. The increase in number of female contestants is partly attributed to the awareness raising activities conducted by the project and partly to registration of more political parties hence wider political space. The number that will triumph is yet to be seen. However, political parties are not proactive in increasing women's participation and there does not seem to have been a meaningful engagement with them by the project. Because no parliamentary elections were held during the project duration, the number of women parliamentarians remains nil as at the baseline.

A key factor constraining women's political participation is the primacy of the clan in determining who contests and who gets elected. Women face the disadvantage of being considered to have ambiguous identity. It was also not possible to measure changes in women's status in the public service due to lack of updated national statistics. As well, no new information was forthcoming on the representation of women in top NGO positions. But at village level, women constitute 18% and 48% of village development committees (VDCs) and CECs for Non Formal Education respectively. The CECs were formed when the project started.

It is therefore concluded that the project has made some limited contribution to the goal through catalysing more women to contest in local council elections, improving their proportion in the VDCs and more or less sustaining their proportion in CECs.

b) Project Purpose

The investment in religious leaders and local elders was relevant considering the influence they have on communal affairs and women's participation in decision making. However, their reported change in attitude in support of women is not detectable in their actions. This is attributable to two things. One is a fear of backlash if they should take a socially unpopular position. Two is the project's approach which did not task them individually to act but assumed that mass sensitisation was sufficient. The beneficiaries of literacy (both male and female) and short courses gained in terms of attitude change and support for women. The latter particularly expressed readiness to campaign and vote for women contesting elections. The literacy gained by women is also positioning them to be eligible for membership in village level committees hence opening public space for them. The women themselves are taking village level collective action to address their rights although this is challenged by lack of guidance and divergent opinions among the women with regard to political participation. On their part, political parties voiced support for women's participation but did not provide proof of any serious undertaking towards putting forward women candidates. None provided documentary proof of gender policies or

specific commitments to enhancing women's political participation rather than the stereotyped women's department and vice chairs in some party committees. The various gains in number of women contesting elections cannot therefore be seen as results of any deliberate action by political parties to promote women's participation in politics but gains by default.

It is concluded that the purpose has been realised only to the extent of theoretical acceptance of women's participation in decision making but it is not backed by palpable action by key determinants like political parties, religious leaders and local elders.

c) Project Results

Result 1: 7,200 women and men in the 30 villages that participate in the literacy programs have the capacity to read and write.

Provisional statistics indicate that those who can read and write are 4,934 (3,359 female, 1,575 male), which is an average of 1,645 annually. The project needs to graduate 2,266 before the end of 2012 in order to achieve the target of 7,200. All the literacy schools were functional at the time of the evaluation. Data gathered in 2010 indicated that 57% (12 villages) of 21 villages had prepared agenda to continue literacy classes, 29% (6 villages) were in the process of doing so while 14% (3 villages) had none. The final evaluation established a verbal commitment to continuing the literacy classes but none of the plans was written, which is ironical for people benefiting from literacy and is regarded as a shortcoming of the project in instilling this as a mandatory demonstration of the value of literacy, indication of organisation and for communal memory. *It is concluded that the project has made a substantial population literate but will fall short of the planned target. Even if it produced the annual average in the remaining period, the project will only have reached 6,579 students.*

Result 2: Men and women in the 30 villages that benefit from the literacy programs value the importance of girls' education.

Beneficiaries are able to provide reasons girls' education and report increasing enrolment of girls in schools. The literacy project emphasised girls' education and testimonies of beneficiaries on the impact of literacy on their own lives indicates that they are likely to promote girls' education. As with agenda to continue literacy classes, there was only verbal support but no written plans hence it was difficult to confirm on the proportion of villages with such agenda. However, a survey of five villages by Nagaad in 2011 indicated that all had plans to increase girls' enrolment and completion but they were again not written. *The lack of specificity on the actions, time frames, responsibility assignment and monitoring system for the reported plans leads to the conclusion that the villages have not produced such plans as envisaged by the project. It is surmised that the project did not invest in guiding them on how to do this and insisting on it hence it was left to their discretion.*

Result 3: Women, men and decision-makers of local communities have increased their knowledge about human rights, including gender equity.

Definitely, there was increased knowledge on women's rights going by respondents' ability to cite relevant reasons in support of women's rights to political participation, role in peace building, freedom violence, education and property. This ability was evident among literacy beneficiaries and elders, as planned by the project. *It is concluded that this result has been satisfactorily achieved.*

Result 4: Increased knowledge and skills of women who participate in decision-making in local councils, government institutions and community awareness in Togdheer Region.

Both secondary data and fresh information generated during the final evaluation indicate that beneficiaries of the short courses had increased knowledge and skills related to their vocations and on women's rights, although the emphasis of the courses appears to have been on the former. All those reached by the final evaluation could demonstrate between two and three ways in which they could support women's participation. A majority would campaign and vote for female candidates; half would create awareness on women's rights; and slightly more than a third would mobilize other people to vote for women. *It is concluded that this result has been satisfactorily achieved.*

Result 5: Local NGOs in Burao have increased capacity to advocate women's participation in decision-making.

In 2010, only three of the implementing agencies held annual coordination meetings. This increased to four in 2011 constituting half of the implementers. The meetings provided publicity and platforms for information sharing on human rights and gender equality. All the implementers attended the project monthly coordination meetings. During the final evaluation, no agency specified the number of annual meetings they held, a finding that tends to indicate that the implementers construed that they were only expected to attend the project's coordination meetings rather than initiate their own. Regarding advocacy initiatives, five of the eight co-implementers conducted advocacy programmes on women's rights but with emphasis on their thematic areas of work with no well articulated plans by the NGOs for linkage, coordination and information sharing. The meetings were largely routine ventures through invitations to individual organizations. The finding by Nagaad in 2011 that all organizations were aware of other organizations' areas of operations appears to be based on their general awareness due to proximity than a result of the project. A major advocacy initiative undertaken by the project was the pressure for the 25% women's parliamentary quota which was, however, rejected by parliament in July 2012 despite its support by the president of the country. And as to active linkages with the Diaspora, only SYS demonstrated concrete linkages that are yielding funds and programmatic support. The other three which mentioned linkages (TWA, SOYVO and Kulmis) were limited to information sharing. *It is concluded that work under this result area was not very effective.*

Result 6: Acceptance of clan elders' for women to have access to decision-making positions.

Elders reached by the final evaluation could cite reasons in support of women's access to decision making. But their acceptance of the same was qualified by a condition that women cannot vie for the senior-most positions in any structures especially the presidency, judiciary,

religion and family. This implies the existence of reservations about women's political participation. The evaluation established that the project facilitated three meetings between clan leaders and female political aspirants in 2011. But the evaluation did not detect any resulting active support by elders for women political aspirants. *It is concluded that the project has created theoretical acceptance and support for women to have decision making positions but with reservations on the senior-most positions.*

In summary, the final evaluation considers that the increased literacy and its impact on women, the appreciation of the value of girls' education, the increased knowledge about human rights and gender equality, benefits from the vocational courses and growing acceptance of women in decision making are positively building towards the realisation of the project purpose. However, more needs to be done on the result on increasing capacity of LNGOs to advocate women's participation with regard to the structured actions they are expected to take. Progress towards the goal is also evident in the increasing number of women contesting the local council elections, the pockets of support for them and the widening political space. However, attitude change remains a major challenge as is the clan enclave and negligible commitment by political parties.

d) External Environment

Political: The prevalent peace and tranquility in Somaliland enabled the project to be implemented uninterrupted. In 2010, a presidential consultative committee moved a motion on having reserved seats for women in parliament. The project log frame was revised to incorporate lobbying for the 25% quota. Although the motion was rejected, it could be seen as a pointer that the political establishment is beginning to take the issue of women's participation in political leadership seriously. The move to allow more political parties to be registered in 2011 led to 15 parties being registered nationwide. This multiplied the platforms for women to seek political office. Revision of the minimum age for eligibility to contest in local council elections was also revised from 35 to 25 years. This has also had a positive impact as seen in the age of female candidates contesting the elections. However, the elections were postponed from April to November 2012 as a result of which many project activities were cancelled. The evaluation was done before the elections, a situation which limited assessment of project impact of the project on women's success in local elections.

Social: The government's free education policy which came into effect from the beginning of 2011 has stimulated enrollment of girls at all levels. On the negative side, traditional division of labour diverted women attending literacy classes to tending cattle while men were also diverted to seasonal income earning opportunities leading to absenteeism. A persistent challenge was chauvinism and reluctance to accept women's participation in the public sphere.

Environmental: The key constraint to the literacy programme was recurrent drought which led to migration and hence discontinuation of classes until communities returned. The net effect was fluctuating class sizes and deferred completion of the programme by some students. Drought also led to communities expecting the project to address their practical needs which were not part of the project mandate.

e) Project Relevance

The project was founded on a needs assessment and baseline study and hence addressed the community's felt needs. All project components were found to be relevant. The literacy component boosted beneficiaries' personal status, provided useful skills for transacting business and is enabling women to claim public space. The awareness on women's rights addressed social resistance and is opening up public space for women. The short courses improved beneficiaries' knowledge on community development, galvanized their support for women's rights and improved their careers.

f) Project Efficiency

On the basis that the project shared limited resources among implementers and had a lean structure but still managed to reach large populations and create positive impact, it is concluded that it was efficient. This was enabled by key strengths such as: Nagaad's experience in dealing with gender issues and its established organisational systems; participatory planning; training and effective coordination of implementers; clear allocation of responsibilities; and collective monitoring. Key weaknesses were: project over-reliance on ISF for supervision due to an apparent inadequate back-up from Nagaad headquarters; limited resources; and capacity gaps among some implementers. But these weaknesses did not upset implementation in any significant way.

g) Sustainability of Results

To a large extent the key project results (literacy, awareness and vocational skills) are self-sustaining. Literacy is particularly expected to spin off into greater support for girls' education and action by a few communities to continue NFE. But for communities to continue with similar initiatives without external support is doubtful considering the levels of poverty, country's level of economic development, harsh climatic environment and embedded cultural and religious beliefs about women's political participation. Nagaad itself is wholly reliant on donor funding to run its programmes and will not be able to continue without such.

h) Capacity Building

Both Nagaad and implementing agencies gained a lot of capacity in terms of office equipment, project management skills, experience in running a rural literacy project and inter-agency collaboration and synergy.

i) Lessons

Resistance: Key pockets of resistance to gender equality are related to embedded belief systems about women's positions. Unless they are dismantled, change will continue to be slow. Projects seeking attitudinal change must thus moderate their expectations and be patient but persist in the quest.

Operational Context: Political and environmental events worked both in favour and against the project. The project adjusted to the events but some of its results that were directly based on assumptions of certain occurrences were put off balance. This calls for continuous assessment of the operational environment to guide decision making but also a thorough risk assessment to avoid predicating important results on uncertain events.

Implementation Strategy/Approach: The key lessons learnt from co-implementation are that: assigning co-implementers specific roles and sites minimises conflict, duplication and competition; and use of multiple actors spreads capacity to more local actors and strengthens local civil society. But success of the approach depends on effective coordination, regular reflections and joint monitoring activities. Targeting of a wide range of stakeholders is necessary but mass engagement without individualised responsibility is not effective. The use of literacy to empower women and as entry points for awareness raising on women's rights was effective but the assumption that it would enable women to self-organise at community level without much assistance was ill-founded. Likewise, the assumption that communities would develop action plans to enrol girls and continue literacy needed to have been facilitated and mandated.

Planning: Some project indicators required action that were not built into project activities, clearly defined or not faithfully followed up e.g. “number of female candidates reporting active support from elders and religious leaders” and “number of parties with gender policies”. The key lesson is that project plans should have clarity and should continue to be refined over the duration of implementation.

Management of Expectations: Carrying out a pre-project needs assessment ensures relevance and clear focus which assists with managing expectations. However, in such environmentally and economically stressed environments as Somaliland, practical livelihood expectations are likely to arise and the project cannot just be oblivious to them. At the same time, project success generates new expectations and demands. This raises an ethical question as to what should happen after project exit considering that the project is responsible for generating such expectations.

1.0 BACKGROUND INFORMATION

This is the report of the final evaluation of the project “Enhancing Women’s Participation in Both Urban and Rural Level Decision Making at all Levels of Society in Togdheer Region”.

1.1 Objective of Final Evaluation

The evaluation was meant to:

1. Analyse the impacts, sustainability, relevance and efficiency of the project with reference to project activities and strategies, and the achievement of the project results, purpose and goal.
2. Reflect the situation of end of 2012 to the situation in 2009 and reflect upon the project’s achievements in the light of the previous project evaluation.

The findings would be used in planning the Gender Equality Programme for the International Solidarity Foundation (ISF) in Somaliland.

1.2 Project Overview

The project “Enhancing Women’s Participation in Both Urban and Rural Level Decision Making at all Levels of Society in Togdheer Region” was planned to be a medium-term project for four years starting April 2009 until December 2012. It builds on previous initiatives between ISF and Nagaad since 2002 to strengthen women’s participation in decision-making institutions in Somaliland.

An evaluation of the previous project to strengthen women’s capacity to participate in Somaliland’s newly emerging democracy conducted in February 2008² found that the key objective of strengthening skills and capacities of women leaders had largely been achieved, but that this had so far had little impact on women’s participation in decision-making. In order to build on previous initiatives and inspire change, the evaluation identified the need to support a women’s political movement with a grassroots mandate in order to create the ‘push’ for women’s political participation and incentivise male-dominated political institutions to include more women. This formed the rationale for the project implemented from 2009 to 2012. A baseline study conducted in February/March 2009 revealed that women’s participation in decision-making institutions in Togdheer was below the national average. However, there were indications that this situation could be improved through women’s increased educational and economic capacity.

The goal of the project was “enhancing gender equality in decision making in Togdheer Region”. The purpose was “increased community acceptance of importance of women in decision-making at all levels of Togdheer Region”. Targeted beneficiaries included co-implementers, local non-governmental organisations (LNGOs), government ministries, media houses, female political

²Nagaad/ISF (2008) *Strengthening Skills in Leadership and Management for Empowerment of Women Leaders in Somaliland: Evaluation of ISF/Nagaad’s ‘Women in Decision-making Project’*. Final Report, June 2008

aspirants, local authorities, university students, clan elders, religious leaders and community education committees (CECs).

The project was focused on grassroots empowerment through delivery of Non Formal Education (NFE), outreach awareness raising, dialogue forums and creation of advocacy and lobbying platforms to stimulate institutional change. This was linked to regional-level advocacy and capacity building activities, including skills trainings for women leaders and selected NGOs, and lobbying of key institutions such as the clan. It used adult literacy as an entry point to address the key obstacle to women's empowerment (lack of education) and create an institutional base for greater awareness on women's rights and leadership.

The project was designed to focus on two main components. The first was literacy for mainly women in 30 target villages to enable them acquire or expand literacy skills. The second was awareness creation on human rights with a focus on women's rights to political participation, property, education and freedom from violence. This was carried out through dialogues and discussions with stakeholders (government, media, business, NGOs, students) and village-level outreach events targeting clan elders, religious leaders and ordinary men and women.

Unlike in the previous projects where implementation was done through the Women in Decision-making (WDM) Forums in the six regions of Somaliland, this new project assumed a new strategy, focusing its main implementation to one region (Togdheer) in order to foreground grassroots engagement. Togdheer was identified by the Ministry of Planning as one of three Eastern regions that remain under-developed (others are Sanaag and Sool). Togdheer also hosts Nagaad's regional office in Burao and thus provides a link with other ISF-supported projects. The overall coordination of the project remained with the WDM Hargeisa office at Nagaad Network headquarters. Table 1 summarises the series of initial and formative project activities.

Table 1: Formative Project Activities

- | |
|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Baseline study conducted in February/March 2009.• 25 rural and 5 urban villages for internally displaced persons (IDPs) selected for NFE centres.• 30 learning centres established (25 in rural villages and five in camps for IDPs in Burao City) and students enrolled.• Dialogue forums for community elders and religious leaders to discuss about human rights and women's participation in decision-making held.• Four awareness workshops held in the most densely populated villages and mobilisation done through public speeches and house to house campaigns.• 22 community mobilizers (13 women and 9 men) identified from target villages and trained to conduct awareness campaigns in rural areas.• Implementing agencies trained on administration and financial management.• Office equipment distributed to implementing agencies.• Working relations established between Nagaad, LNGOs and line ministries.• Qualified teachers identified and recruited from the target villages, the central two criteria being their level of education and origination from the target village. |
|---|

Source: Project Annual Report 2009.

ISF provided funding and participated in planning, communication, information sharing, and monitoring and evaluation. It approved annual/quarterly budgets and received quarterly and annual financial and narrative reports.

Nagaad participated in planning, budgeting, coordination, awareness creation, supervision, monitoring, financial control and quarterly and annual reporting. It deployed four members of staff namely Programme Coordinator, Project Manager, Finance and Administration Officer and driver, all in Burao. It coordinated the other agencies through monthly meetings and provision of transport for field visits. Monitoring was done collectively by implementers and standardised formats used for reporting based on the monitoring tool completed in December 2010 after a training on Monitoring and Evaluation. Nagaad also conducted capacity building training for co-implementers.

The Programme Coordinator in Burao received project plans from the Project Manager and submitted them to the senior management, approved expenditures according to the budget and was signatory to project bank accounts. The head office in Hargesia supported the Burao office through: proposal writing; link with the donor; recruitment of staff; training (e.g. on operational guidelines); publicity; information sharing; compilation and submission of monthly, quarterly and annual reports to the donor; and monitoring visits by the Board of Directors, Executive Director, Project Officer or Finance and Administration Officer. Nagaad's Information Technology specialist prepared a shared folder for instant connectivity between Burao and headquarters. Routine communication was done through Skype, email and telephone. The implementing agencies participated in hiring, deployment and supervision of teachers, running literacy classes, monitoring and reporting.

The project was implemented by six LNGOs and two umbrella organisations³. The LNGOs focused on the literacy component while the umbrella organisations dealt with awareness creation and advocacy on women's rights to political participation, property, freedom from violence and education. The literacy classes were also used as primary entry points for mobilising support for women's rights.

Each of the LNGOs was allocated five sites (four rural villages and one IDP camp in Burao). Each deployed five teachers identified and recruited from the local community and paid by project funds. The gender distribution of the teachers was as follows: DAWO (all male), SYS (one female and four male), SOYVO (three female and two male), Sabuux (one female and four male), TWA (one female and four male) and SOLCO (one female and four male). Some of the organisations also deployed their own internal resources to support the project although such were not paid by the project. These included project focal points (DAWO), part time education specialist (SOYVO) and Administration and Finance Officer (SYS, SOYVO). All LNGOs were given similar resources and workload. The key working methods were:

³ The six LNGOs were Development Organisation for Women (DAWO), Somaliland Children's Organisation (SOLCO), Somaliland Youth Development Organization (SOYDAVO), Somaliland Youth and Voluntary Organisation (SOYVO), Somaliland Youth Society (SYS) and Togdheer Women's Association (TWA) while the umbrella organisations were KULMIS and United Trust Association (UNITA).

- a) Training for literacy teachers who then prepared lesson plans, conducted classes, prepared and administered tests, attended meetings and submitted monthly reports to the project focal points.
- b) Monthly meetings by self-organised groups of women attending literacy classes to deliberate on women's rights issues and take action at village level.
- c) Awareness raising campaigns through open forums, workshops, debates, discussions, distribution of information education communication materials and drama on women's rights and girls' education.
- d) Sponsorship of women for short courses at Burao University.
- e) Coordination meetings for implementers for information sharing on activities implemented, achievements, constraints, lessons and needed adjustments.

2.0 METHODOLOGY

2.1 Schedule

The final evaluation was conducted between September 29 and October 9, 2012. The field work was carried out from October 3 to 9, 2012.

2.2 Data Types and Sources

There were two sets of data derived from the evaluation. First were quantitative data on the number of beneficiaries as specified in the project logical framework. This information was principally gathered from project reports. Second were qualitative information gathered from informants during field work. The informants were: ISF, Nagaad project staff, Nagaad management, implementing agency staff, an official of the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, staff of regional NGOs, female and male beneficiaries in urban and rural areas (literacy students, participants in short courses, religious leaders and local elders). The respondents were selected based on the criteria in Table 2.

Table 2: Respondent Selection Criteria

SN	Category	Selection Criteria
1	Implementing agencies.	<p>To shed light on all aspects of implementation and levels of results with particular reference to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance of the project to the needs of the target group and alignment with national development goals. • Institutional relationships during implementation. • Adequacy and use of project inputs. • Factors that facilitated and constrained implementation. • Results achieved. • Statistics to quantify level of achievement and evidence on qualitative achievements. • Case studies to illustrate findings. • Lessons learnt. • Potential for sustainability.
2	Project beneficiaries (target women)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To corroborate achievement i.e. number of beneficiaries and changes in their lives (impact) e.g. evidence of literacy, increase in knowledge on women's rights, participation in decision making structures and acceptance by clan

SN	Category	Selection Criteria
	and men).	<p>elders.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To provide case studies of project impact and challenges. • To gauge potential for sustainability by establishing sense of ownership and nature of potential contributions towards the project. • To establish relevance of the project. • To propose necessary improvements in terms of focus, implementation strategies and community involvement for sustainability.
3	Regional NGOs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To establish evidence of women's ascension to and increase in number of women in NGO leadership positions. • To gauge level of inter-agency collaboration. • To gauge potential for sustainability. • To triangulate findings on achievement, facilitating and constraining factors, lessons learnt and relevance.
4	Government officials.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To establish alignment of the project to national development goals and hence its relevance to the beneficiaries and the government. • To triangulate findings on levels of achievement. • To provide statistics based on the project's quantitative indicators e.g. on number of women in district councils, party regional executives, parliament and public sector. • To provide insights on potential for sustainability. • To shed light on factors that facilitated and constrained the project from a government perspective i.e. social, political or/and economic environment. • To provide insights on future direction.
5	Political parties.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To gauge results achieved with particular reference to: increase in number of women in political party positions and their levels of participation; effect of the project on attitudes by political parties towards women's political leadership (gender sensitivity of political parties and acceptance of women's leadership); and existence and content of gender policies in political parties and other enabling factors within the political parties i.e. party commitment to women's rights. • To establish the potential contribution of political parties towards sustainability. • To identify facilitating and constraining political factors to the project.
6	Religious leaders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To establish influence of the project on the attitude of religious leaders towards women's leadership and gender equality. • To establish the involvement of religious leaders in the project and the extent to which they facilitated or hindered the project. • To gauge the nature of contribution religious leaders can make towards sustainability. • To generate illustrative case studies on how religion and religious leaders have supported and can support women's leadership and enhance women's rights and gender equality.
7	Elders.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To establish elders' awareness of women's rights and gender sensitivity. • To gauge changes in elders' attitudes towards women's leadership and participation in decision making. • To generate case studies to illustrate how elders have supported and can support women's empowerment and leadership and act as change agents or vice versa.
8	Community women and men.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To generate evidence of achievement with regard to: participation of women and men in literacy programs and improvements in ability to read and write; attitude towards girls' education; increase in knowledge on human rights, including gender equity; and community acceptance for women to have access

SN	Category	Selection Criteria
		<p>to decision-making positions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To outline community level factors that facilitated or constrained the project. • To generate illustrative case studies on impact. • To establish number and nature of collective actions women in target villages have taken to address women's right to political participation, role in peace building, right to education, right to property ownership and freedom from violence and the results achieved. • To identify social, political or/and economic factors that influenced the project. • To gauge relevance of the project. • To establish how community men and women can contribute towards sustainability.
10	Nagaad project staff	<p>To provide overall insight on the planning and implementation of the project with specific reference to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevance of project. • Activities planned and implemented. • Strategies used, their advantages and disadvantages e.g. regional focus, use of implementing partners etc. • Factors that facilitated or hindered implementation: social, political and economic. • Efficiency: inputs, their adequacy, adjustments made, adherence to implementation schedule etc. • Achievements (at impact, purpose, output levels) • Organizational strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats. • Actual and potential contributions of Nagaad to sustainability. • Lessons learnt.
11	Nagaad management	<p>To provide insight on the planning and implementation of the project from a management perspective with specific reference to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How lessons from past projects and findings of evaluations were built into the project. • Organizational capacity. • Interface between Nagaad, implementing partners and ISF. • Management of project resources. • Supervision and reporting. • Factors that facilitated or hindered implementation: social, political and economic. • Efficiency: inputs, their adequacy, adjustments made, adherence to implementation schedule etc. • Achievements (at impact, purpose, output levels) and challenges. • Organizational strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats. • Actual and potential contributions of Nagaad to sustainability. • Lessons learnt.
12	ISF	<p>To provide insight on the planning and implementation of the project from a sponsor's perspective with specific reference to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alignment of project with ISF objectives and programming principles. • Organizational capacities of Nagaad and implementing partners. • Management of project resources. • Supervision and reporting issues. • Factors that facilitated or hindered implementation: social, political and economic. • Efficiency: inputs, their adequacy, adjustments made, adherence to implementation schedule etc.

SN	Category	Selection Criteria
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Achievements (at impact, purpose, output levels) and challenges. • Recommendations based on ISF priorities.

2.3 Respondents

There were 122 respondents categorised as follows.

Table 3: List of Respondents by Category

SN	Category	Female	Male	Total
1	ISF	1	0	1
2	Nagaad project staff	1	1	2
3	Nagaad management and board	6	1	7
4	Literacy beneficiaries	23	24	47
5	Beneficiaries of short courses	8	0	8
6	Religious leaders	0	7	7
7	Local leaders/elders	0	9	9
8	Regional NGOs	0	3	3
9	Government ministries	0	1	1
10	Implementing agencies	8	3	11
11	Political parties	7	19	26
	Total	55 (48%)	68 (52%)	122

2.4 Data Collection Instruments

The evaluation used the following instruments:

- Focus group discussions with: members of Nagaad's Board of Directors; female beneficiaries of the literacy component in Unuunlay and Odweyne villages; male beneficiaries of the literacy component in Ceelbicile and Yiroowe villages; religious leaders; and local elders.
- Key informant interviews using semi-structured interviews with ISF, Nagaad project staff, Nagaad management, management and staff of implementing agencies, staff of regional agencies and two elders in Yiroowe Village.
- Mail questionnaire for beneficiaries of short courses.
- Observation of project sites and beneficiaries.

2.5 Data Analysis and Reporting

Findings have been analysed in line with the project logical framework and baseline. Quantitative findings are presented in narrative and tabular forms while qualitative findings are narrated. The findings are organised around the following themes: project goal; project purpose; project results; relevance; external and organisational environment; efficiency,

strengths and weaknesses; sustainability; lessons learnt; past evaluation; conclusions; and recommendations.

2.6 Challenges Faced

The following challenges were faced during data collection.

- a) *Language*: The evaluator was not a speaker of the Somali language and had to rely on a translator to communicate with literacy beneficiaries, religious leaders, local elders and political parties. This category included beneficiaries of the literacy component, elders, religious leaders and a few members of the implementing agencies. Translation slowed down the data collection and essentially increased the amount of time spent with respondents.
- b) *Time*: The field work was essentially a rapid data collection at project sites. Some time was lost through travel between sites. In some cases, respondents were interviewed in the afternoon when it was hot, levels of attention were not optimal and respondents were in a hurry to proceed to other concerns. This meant prioritising the questions and focusing on the bigger picture rather than details. Time available was also limited by the short official working hours in Somaliland (8.00-2.00 p.m.) which constrained attention of respondents beyond these times. Time constraints also led to beneficiaries of short courses being reached through mail questionnaires rather than face to face interaction.
- c) *Pre-testing*: Ideally, the data collection tools should have been pre-tested and revised before use. Due to time constraints, it was not possible to do so and the evaluator had to revise the tools in the process of data collection. Some tools were too long for respondent attention and had to be shortened on site to focus on priority questions.
- d) *Sample*: For the literacy project, the evaluation focused only on the current beneficiaries due to their ready availability. It would have been ideal to access even past beneficiaries especially to measure longer-term effects.
- e) *Perception of Evaluation*: Some categories of respondents, implementing agencies in particular, were keen to highlight only the positive aspects of the project. To manage this, the evaluator re-framed questions in such a way that both sides were discussed.

On the other hand, the exercise was facilitated by the following factors.

1. *Respondent Mobilisation*: Nagaad did an excellent job identifying respondents and scheduling appointments. Some respondents were available even after working hours and over the weekend. This enabled the evaluator to cover a substantial number of respondents directly.
2. *Logistics*: Travel logistics and security for the evaluator were available and well coordinated.
3. *Access*: The exercise targeted easily reachable villages which enabled wide daily coverage.

3.0 FINDINGS OF THE EVALUATION

The findings of the evaluation combine secondary data in the custody of Nagaad and primary information generated during the final evaluation.

3.1 Project Goal

The evaluation established the following regarding the extent to which the project is moving towards “enhancing gender equality in decision making in Togdheer Region”.

- *Indicator 1: Number and proportion of women in Togdheer Region districts’ local councils.*

There are 26 women candidates in Togdheer Region contesting in the November 2012 local government elections. This is the first such elections in the lifespan of the project. It is not known how many of the candidates will triumph. But this number is a distinct improvement from December 2002 when no woman from the region contested⁴. In 2012, 142 women are contesting local elections nationwide. This is only 6% of 2,368 total contestants nationwide.

Many of the candidates have been participants in Nagaad workshops and some are either currently attending or have completed the literacy classes. In fact, some of the candidates interviewed indicated that the ability to read and write has enabled them to be approved by political parties because it is one of the requirements by the National Electoral Commission.

Regional NGOs interviewed attributed the increase in number of female contestants to the awareness raising activities conducted by the project. Women who attended courses at the University of Burao averred that the courses stimulated women’s interest in political leadership leading to the increase in the number of women contestants. Respondents pointed out that the awareness has impacted on clan elders whose acceptance of women’s candidacy is necessary. The mass media exposure for women was also cited as a contributor to creating public awareness on female candidates. Elders and religious leaders attributed the changes to women’s increased participation in formal education and employment and their own support for women’s participation.

External factors that contributed to the improvement include registration of more political parties which has increased the space for competition. The trend is building upon the experiences of the 2010 presidential elections in which there were more women recruited as polling officials. During these elections, the Kulmiye Party promised women 25% of places in government as a pre-election pact with Nagaad. On July 7, 2012, Nagaad organised a meeting with parliament to discuss the issue as one way of overcoming women’s obstacles to political office. However, the quota was rejected by parliament reportedly on the basis that women do not constitute a minority in Somaliland hence affirmative action for them was unconstitutional.

⁴ Other elections held over the last decade have been: first presidential elections (April 12, 2003), House of Representatives elections (September 29, 2005) and second presidential elections (June 26, 2010).

- *Indicator 2: Number and proportion of women in party regional executives.*

There are seven political parties in Togdheer Region. Table 4 summarises the number of women in the parties at national level in 2012 compared with 2009.

Table 4: Representation of Women in Political Party Structures 2009 & 2012

Party & Date of Formation	Central Committee				Executive Committee				Highest post held by women	
	2009		2012		2009		2012		2009	2012
	Total	Women	Total	Women	Total	Women	Total	Women		
Umadda (February 2012)	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	No data	No data	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of four vice chairs.
Kulmiye (2001)	No data	No data	12	3	2	0	7	2	Member Executive Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Member Executive Committee • Chair, Women's Department.
UCID (2001)	No data	No data	No data	No data	10	3	No data	No data	Member Executive Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No data
Dalsan (March 26, 2009)	N/A	N/A	45	23	N/A	N/A	15	6 ⁵	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vice Chair, Executive Committee • Togdheer Regional Vice Chair.
RAYS (October 2011)	N/A	N/A	No data	No data	N/A	N/A	21	5	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No data
Wadani (October 2011)	N/A	N/A	55	6	N/A	N/A	15	2 ⁶	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2nd Vice Chair, Executive Committee
Xaqsoor (October 2011)	N/A	N/A	250	62	N/A	N/A	17	5	N/A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 3rd Vice Chair out of 4 in Executive Committee • Regional Vice Chair Togdheer

Source: Final Evaluation 2012

The table indicates Dalsan Party as leading in the number of women in its party structures although women are a minority in all party structures. It also indicates that women are consigned

⁵ The party respondent indicated that 14 out of 30 members are women, which conflicts with the figures in the data provided to Nagaad. It also indicated that 70 of the 204 National Council members are women.

⁶ The evaluator was told that one out of five Executive Committee members is a woman.

to vice chairs of committees and chairs of women's departments. Nagaad reports that vice chairs and chairpersons of women's departments in all political parties are women. Other information gathered was that:

- a) In RAYS Party, women are 15% of the party's leadership. The party is planning to distribute posts afresh once the local council elections have been held.
 - b) In Kulmiye, 30% of the 205 National Council members are women. The party currently has two women in parliament. In 2002, one female member of the party called Khadra Haji Geydh became Vice Mayor for Gabiley. She eventually became Mayor in 2011 and is credited for creating major change in the city's development.
 - c) Umadda is planning to form a regional committee of seven members of whom 2-3 will be women. It will also have a Women's Department to be headed by a woman.
- *Indicator 3: Number of Togdheer women who are parliamentarians.*

Currently, there are no female parliamentarians from Togdheer. No parliamentary elections were held during the project's lifespan to enable measurement of this indicator. The baseline remains that nationally there are two women in the 82 member parliament and one woman in the 82 member Guurti (House of Elders). Reportedly, the female Guurti member joined after her husband's death and was proposed by her clan principally in order for her livelihood (i.e. draw her husband's salary because membership in the Guurti is permanent). The other factor that propelled her was the inability of the clan to agree on a replacement for the husband due to competing interests. So she was a compromise candidate. But she is also educated and sociable.

Political party respondents mentioned the following obstacles to women's political participation.

- a) Religion prohibits women from holding the presidency and post of senior-most judge.
 - b) Clans, which are the principal determinants of candidates, favour men. Thus if all candidates are from one clan, it is inconceivable to see the clan supporting a female over a male candidate. Women intending to contest also have to shelve their ambitions should a close male relative (husband or uncle) offer candidature. Otherwise she could be deemed disrespectful and impudent.
 - c) Many men are skeptical about women's leadership abilities.
 - d) Women have less formal education, campaign resources and political experience than men.
 - e) Women are constrained by maternity, workload and domestication.
 - f) Women voters favour men.
- *Indicator 4: Proportion and status of women in the public sector.*

No information was received with regard to this indicator due to lack of updated national data. However, after the 2010 presidential elections, three women were appointed to the Cabinet (Ministers for Education, Labour & Social Affairs and Vice Minister for Health and Chief of Relief). In Togdheer Region, two regional coordinators were nominated for the Ministry of Social Affairs and Labour. The situation at baseline is captured in Table 5.

Table 5: Representation of Women in the Public Service 2009

Quantity (2009)	National	Togdheer
Total employees	1,100	220
Number of women in administrative positions	200	16
Proportion of women	18%	7%
Highest status of women employees	Minister of Family Affairs and Social Development	Regional Officer of Ministry of Family Affairs and Social Development.

Source: Baseline Survey Report 2008.

- *Indicator 5: Number of women in regional top NGO positions.*

No information was received with regard to this indicator. Table 6 captures the baseline situation.

Table 6: Representation of Women in Top NGO Positions 2009

Quantity (2009)	Togdheer
Number of NGOs	25
Number of women executive directors	5
Number of men EDs	20
Proportion of women EDs	20%
Number of women project managers/coordinators	2
Number of men project managers/coordinators	23
Proportion of women project managers/ coordinators	12%
Number of women chairpersons	10
Number of men chairpersons	15
Proportion of women chairpersons	40%

Source: Baseline Survey Report 2008.

- *Indicator 6: Proportion of women in village committees.*

Table 7 captures the situation at baseline and at the time of the final evaluation with regard to this indicator. The current data is based on women's participation in two village committees in target villages.

Table 7: Women’s Representation in Leadership in Village Structures 2009 & 2012

Indicator	Quantity (Jan 2012)	2009	2012
Village Development Committee	Number of members	12	229
	Number of women	1	41
	Proportion of women	10%	18%
	Highest status of woman members	Membership	Finance officer / member
Education committee (formal)	Number of members	15	
	Number of women	2	
	Proportion of women	13%	
	Highest status of woman members	Membership	
	Date formed	Unclear	
Education committee (non-formal)	Number of members	4	195
	Number of women	2	94
	Proportion of women	50%	48%
	Highest status of woman members	N/A	Vice chair
	Date formed	2008	2009 up to 2012

Source: Final Evaluation Report 2012 and Baseline Survey Report 2008

The table indicates that women constitute 18% and 48% of the membership of village development committees (VDCs) and CECs for NFE respectively. This represents a slight improvement from 10% in 2009 in the VDC and a slight regression from 50% in the CECs. The CECs were formed by each targeted village in 2009 when the project started. No data was reported for formal education committees in 2012.

3.2 Project Purpose

The evaluation established the following concerning the project’s progress towards “increased community acceptance of importance of women in decision-making at all levels of Togdheer Region”.

- *Indicator 1: Attitude changes of identified elders and religious leaders towards women’s participation in decision making institutions.*

The project invested in creating attitudinal change through several forums targeting elders and religious leaders. In 2010, it convened a workshop which was attended by 100 male clan elders on good governance and women in decision making. In 2011:

- 14 males (traditional elders, Minister of Religion) and 16 females from women’s peace associations participated in a two day strategic planning workshop on Togdheer’s women’s representation in local councils and parliament.
- 100 male traditional leaders, religious leaders, chiefs and clan elders participated in a forum on the importance of women in decision-making, democratic governance and the role of citizens.

And on October 2, 2012, the project convened 25 elders who endorsed women to compete for any post except that of president as proscribed by Sharia.

The elders indicated that they participated in six regional meetings convened by Nagaad for leaders on how to promote women's participation in 2010. They later arranged public awareness creation sessions to change attitudes towards women.

During an evaluative FGD, elders indicated that they used to believe that women were inferior and belonged only to the domestic sphere. But they have now accepted that women have a role in public life and can even outperform men in some circumstances. They were categorical that Islam does not prohibit women's participation and leadership although it bars them from holding the presidency. They indicated that they can educate people about this because they have the tools for creating change. In the words of one elder:

We are the people who elect leaders or enable them to be elected. We elect the Guurti and have brought peace to the country. If we decide that something is a common interest, it will be done.

The elders also indicated that they apply this attitudinal change in their own families by sending their daughters to school and sharing decision-making roles with their wives although they remained the "chairs" of such decision making processes. However, they believe that they could be more effective if facilitated by Nagaad with resources to conduct community mobilization rather than relying on their own resources.

Asked whether they intervened with political parties to present more female candidates, the elders responded that being peace keepers, mobilizers and creators of free and fair atmosphere for elections, they have to exercise neutrality. They characterised political parties as sales people and the voters as their customers.

An interview with two elders in Yiroowe Village largely reflected the position taken by elders in the FGD. Asked whether they support women vying for political office, the two responded in the negative giving the reason that it is for candidates to offer themselves and sell their credentials. But they would support a woman with a strong programme. While this response indicates an ideological flexibility and acceptance of women's leadership, it does not recognise that women probably need the active endorsement, encouragement and support of elders even to have the confidence to offer their candidature.

Religious leaders also indicated that they accepted women's right to participate in decision making except as president and supreme judge which, they said, are proscribed by Sharia. They were categorical that women cannot be topmost decision makers in any structure. Like the elders, they reported using the awareness in their personal lives by sending own daughters to school, mobilising communities for the same and campaigning against violence against women. They also pointed out that they did not effectively support the affirmative quota for women and have not been supporting female candidates economically. However, one came out strongly to indicate that he was interviewed by the committee on the quota, he supported it and urged parliament to pass it.

- *Indicator 2: Attitude changes of men and women beneficiaries with respect to women's participation in decision making institutions.*

This indicator was measured through beneficiaries of the literacy programme. Both male and female respondents indicated that men still dominate decision making institutions. However, they reported attitude change as a result of awareness by the project. FGDs for male and female beneficiaries fluently stated that the project took them through awareness: equal rights to education; freedom from violence; right to participate in community structures and politics; right to participate in peace building; and right to employment. The male beneficiaries reported that only a few of them were supportive of women before the project but now most of them are. They cited the female project focal points and literacy teachers as examples that girls and women can become leaders. "I initially believed that sending girls to school was a waste of time", stated one male beneficiary. "Now I understand that it is beneficial to her and to the whole community".

To apply their change of attitude, the male beneficiaries reported that they are sending their own daughters to school, are creating awareness for families to send girls to school and have allowed women to talk in meetings freely and become members of village committees. Female beneficiaries corroborated this by citing increases in the number of women in village committees. One of the female respondents in Unuunlay Village indicated that she had joined the village management committee which deals with peace, conflicts and overall village welfare. SYS reported that there are women participating in decision making structures. Some have joined village committees and one trainee became a member of the CECs while three in Burao are standing for local councils and mobilizing other women to participate in elections as candidates and voters. Male respondents in the FGD at Ceelbicile reported that there were only men in the VDCs previously, but now there are three women out of 10 members. The education committee also has three women out of seven members. At Odweyne, five of the female respondents indicated that they are contesting the local council elections.

All beneficiaries of the university courses were affirmative that the project has increased community acceptance of the importance of women in decision-making at all levels of Togdheer Region. Evidence cited were that: there is support for women by some elders and religious leaders; and there is no public hostility towards women contesting in local council elections. The course beneficiaries indicated that the project fundamentally energized them to support women's rights and the women seeking political office.

- *Indicator 3: Number of female candidates reporting active support from elders and religious leaders.*

There were no specific numbers gathered and reported by the project on this indicator. The project simply did not put in place a mechanism for gathering this data. This betrays a limited contact of the project with the candidates and with the elders and religious leaders expected to provide the support. However, it was considered by implementers that the female candidates in local council elections could not have stood if they did not get the support of elders and religious leaders. An FGD with clan elders was non-conclusive on actual support advanced to female contestants. Only one out of seven stated that he had shown his support by writing a letter of recommendation for a female candidate endorsing her as qualified for selection by her political

party and she was placed on the list of candidates. From religious leaders, four out of seven said they are actively campaigning for women, were committed to voting for women and were asking others to look at the women's credentials not sex. One reported having participated in a forum with a female aspirant. But all the women contestants interviewed did not reveal substantial support from elders and religious leaders. In fact, they cited clan elders as one of their major bottlenecks.

- *Indicator 4: Number of incidences in target villages where women have taken collective actions to address women's right to political participation, role in peace building, right to education, right to property ownership and freedom from violence.*

The annual report for 2009 indicates that five women's rights advocacy groups were formed in Nasiye, Gatiitalay, Ceel Same, Odweyne and Qoyta NFE centres. These groups worked on women's affairs through monthly community based women's meetings. But they differed on how to address women's rights issues. While all groups supported the rights to education, property ownership, freedom from violence and participation in peace building, there was divergence on support for women's participation in politics. It was also reported that women who had attended literacy classes were more active in these advocacy groups than their illiterate counterparts. This is attributed to the fact that the beneficiaries of the literacy programme benefited from awareness raising and capacity building to advocate for women and hence were more confident. An FGD with female beneficiaries in Unuunlay Village established that the women conduct mobilization and awareness creation for villages, hold coordination meetings with leaders and hold female-only monthly meetings to discuss personal problems such as violence. They gather the women's concerns and report them to the village elder to intervene e.g. with violent husbands. Other agenda items include: women's rights to vote, be free from violence and educate girls. In general, however, the women's collective actions were not well coordinated and focused.

- *Indicator 5: Party commitment on increasing number of women candidates put forward.*

The final evaluation gathered information from political parties on their commitment to increasing the number of women candidates put forward as follows.

- a) XAQSOOR: This is a new party. It has two female candidates in Burao and one in Odweyne for the 2012 local council elections.
- b) Dalsan: This is also a new party. It has one female candidate contesting in Burao. Incidentally, this party has a large number of women (23 out of 45 members) in its Central Committee. Asked why these women are not contesting, the party replied that candidates have to offer themselves before the party can endorse them. True as it is, the reply betrays a less than proactive attitude towards encouraging women to contest.
- c) RAYS: Seven women are contesting the elections nationwide from the party. It is a new party.
- d) Kulmiye: In 2002, the party had no woman candidate in the local council elections. Now it has one in Burao, three in Ainaboo and three in Odweyne. The Burao female candidate has a track record and even contested the position of Secretary General of the party, losing by a

small margin of 16 votes. The party has two women in parliament currently and had promised women 25% quota during the 2010 presidential elections.

- e) Umadda: The party is fielding two female candidates in Togdheer. It was formed in February 2012.
- f) UCID: In the 2005 parliamentary elections, the party had only one female candidate nationally. Now it has three in Burao and three in Odweyne. The increase is attributed to women's increased awareness of their rights and willingness to exercise them.
- g) Waddani: At the national level, there are 12 female candidates from the party. Posters on the party's office wall showed three women out of 14 candidates in local elections at the regional level; however, one stepped down due to domestic difficulties.

- *Indicator 6: Existence of gender policy in each political party at national head office.*

The evaluation sought to establish the number of political parties with gender policies. Responses from Nagaad head office indicated that Kulmiye, UCID and Waddani reported that they have gender policies. Interviews with representatives of the seven parties yielded affirmative responses from RAYS, Kulmiye, Dalsan, UCID and Umadda. However, none of the parties produced copies and cited the following reasons for this situation: it was at party headquarters (Dalsan, Umadda, and UCID); it was in the custody of the Regional Chair and Secretary (Kulmiye); and it was in the mainstream party policy to encourage and empower women (Xaqsoor, Waddani). Dalsan pointed out that it supports women's participation except for the post of president; RAYS promised to mail the policy but did not; Kulmiye cited its presentation of the 25% quota motion to parliament, two female parliamentarians and the Mayor as evidence of its policy; Umadda stated that its commitment is in line with the country's constitution; and Waddani averred that it has a policy on women's participation but has no affirmative statement or quota. Xaqsoor indicated that it has a policy to allocate women 40% of membership and leadership. But this is constrained by the criteria set by the Electoral Commission for nomination of candidates (which many women do not meet) and the low numbers of women offering themselves as candidates.

The idea of a gender policy is prone to different interpretations. On the one hand, it could mean a separate elaborate document with specific measures. On the other, it can be an orientation captured in the overall party policy framework and commitment to equality ideals in the country's constitution. Whichever way, the evaluation considered that each party claiming to have a policy should have copies of it. In the absence of documentary proof, it was impossible to confirm that the parties actually have gender policies (as separate documents or mainstreamed in party policies). It is not conceivable that out of seven, not even one had a copy of its policy in the regional office. In deed this would be something the parties would be flaunting to gain women's support if they had them. In any case, Nagaad could and should have acquired samples.

3.3 Project Results

The evaluation established the following with regard to the level of achievement of results against stated indicators.

Result 1: 7,200 women and men in the 30 villages that participate in the literacy programs have the capacity to read and write.

- *Indicator 1: Number of women and men that finished literacy courses that can read and write.*

The annual report for 2009 indicates that 1,502 students were registered for the year and 1,092 (723 women and 369) men could read and write by the end of the year. In 2010, a total of 890 (537 female, 353 male) could read and write. In 2011, those who could read and write were 1,452 (1,035 female, 417 male).⁷ 52 (7 female, 45 male) students were reported to have dropped out or failed the tests in 2011. In 2012, the project:

- Enrolled and registered 1,095 female and 465 male new students.
- Distributed learning stationery to the new students.
- Conducted TOT training for 30 (25 male, 5 female) literacy teachers.
- Monitored literacy classes regularly.
- Prepared for the final examination.
- Held final examinations for 1,560 (1095 female, 465 male) students.
- Certified 1,500 (1064 female, 436 male) literacy graduates.

From the training, teachers gained professional skills (preparing schemes of work and lesson plans, methods of teaching and how to evaluate and measure achievements of students). They also indicated improved understanding of basic human rights, gender based violence and the importance of girl's education. All implementers indicated that only students who achieved the required proficiency in literacy and numeracy are graduated and certified by the Ministry of Education (MOE) which also monitors the quality of instruction provided.

The data on those certified as able to read and write by end of 2011 work out to a total of 3,434 (2,295 female, 1,139 male). Added to the 1,500 (1,064 female, 436 male) certified in 2012, the total comes to 4,934 (3,359 female, 1,575 male), which is an average of 1,645 annually. The project needs to graduate 2,266 before the end of 2012 in order to achieve the target of 7,200. Even if it produced the annual average in the remaining period, the project will only have reached 6,579 students. All factors being constant, it is not foreseen that the project will realise the target.

The evaluation independently verified the ability to read and write through practical on-site tests for FGD respondents. In Yiroowe and Unuunlay villages, male and female FGD participants respectively were given pieces of paper and asked to write their names, ages, marital status, villages of origin, occupations and how literacy had changed their lives. All were able to do so.

⁷ This includes 162 (115 female, 47 male) who had been displaced by drought in the previous years but received their certificates in 2011.

In Unuunlay, a randomly selected female FGD respondent was able to read the inscriptions on a water bottle while the others (all female) were able to read posters displayed on the classroom wall. In Ceelbilcile Village, male FGD respondents were able to write letters to the project's sponsors.

- *Indicator 2: Number of literacy schools assessed and rated as functioning adequately during literacy programmes in the targeted villages.*

All annual reports indicated that all classes were functional as a result of the project's provision of stationery and teachers' salary. At the time of the evaluation, there were 41 functional literacy classes (6 urban and 35 rural) located in: Qoyta, Karasharka, Boodhley, Galooley, Ceel-bilcile, Odweyne, Xaaxi, Gatiitaley, Balihiile, Bilcilweyso, Labiguun, Waraabeeye, Ali-Saahid, Xangeyo, Goroya-ood, Cali-Faarah, Yiroowe, Beer, Unuunlay, Wadama-goo, Caynaba, Qoryaale, Magaalo-yar, Higlo, Aadan-Suleiban IDP, Cakaara IDP, Maxamed Ali (A) IDP, Maxamed Ali (B) IDP, Tabantaabo IDP, Sheikh-Bashiir IDP, Ceelsame, Beerato, Galooley, Iskudhoon, Geedihaan, Nasiye, Gaatama, Kalbare, Dindinta, Obsiye and Ceeg.

Classes in the four sites visited by the evaluator (Yiroowe, Ceelbilcile, Odweyne and Unuunlay) were all functional. The Yiroowe class is one room of corrugated iron with basic furniture. It can become very hot and uncomfortable during sunny days. It is rented and paid for by the school teacher at US\$ 10 a month. The Unuunlay class is a permanent structure rented at US\$ 20 a month. At Ceelbilcile, the classes are conducted in the nearby primary school which has permanent buildings. And at Odweyne, the class is a permanent room. All the classes were reported to run from 2 to 4 pm daily. This time was decided on in recognition of women's work (tending cattle in the morning hours).

- *Indicator 3: Number of villages that have developed plans to continue adult literacy schools after project exit.*

The 2009 annual report indicates that two NFE areas (Qoyta and Ali Farah) had set agenda to continue literacy classes after project phase-out. In 2010, it reported that 10 rural villages from which the programme had shifted promised to continue the literacy program. 12 of the 21 villages surveyed by Nagaad in 2011 indicated that they had prepared agenda to continue, six were in the process of preparing the agenda while three had none. Some villages with such plans included: Qoyta, Balihiile, Bilcilweyso, Cakaara IDP, Maxamed Ali (A) IDP, Maxamed Ali (B) IDP, Tabantaabo IDP and Sheikh-Bashiir IDP. It was also reported that: 10 villages were willing to cover the teacher's incentives through contributions by the village; five indicated that teachers will volunteer their services; one indicated that business owners will provide sponsorship; and five planned to substitute the literacy teachers with those from the formal school system.

The four FGDs for beneficiaries indicated that such plans were there. At Yiroowe, the willingness to continue was expressed and evidenced by a citation that ideas already floated include: collecting funds from villagers; teachers continuing to offer their services; and use of voluntary teachers. The main challenge expected is inability to pay teachers. Unuunlay indicated a plan to continue. At Odweyne, it was reported that the CEC and literacy teachers have met and discussed the issue. The teachers are reportedly willing to volunteer and the committee will

manage the programme. The literacy graduates can also help in teaching others. At Ceelbicile, it was indicated that the village has met and agreed to continue. Therefore, it is creating awareness so that those who cannot read and write can come out thus help in establishing the magnitude of need. It has set a target that after five years from now, there should be no illiterate person in the village. The village committee will work out local ways of raising funds to pay the teachers. It is planning to ensure 50% gender parity in future literacy classes. During the evaluation, the village was excavating a plot near the primary school on which to build a water tank specifically for the literacy students.

None of the reported plans were not written, which is a discouraging finding considering that the project reports training CEC members from targeted villages on community development, human rights and producing agenda and action plans.

Result 2: Men and women in the 30 villages that benefit from the literacy programs value the importance of girls' education.

- *Indicator 1: Groups of women and men in 30 villages that participate in the literacy program are able to identify at least two reasons why girls should be educated.*

In 2009, the project mounted a girl child advocacy through the two umbrella organizations. The co-implementers recruited and trained 22 community mobilizers (13 female, 9 male). As a result, massive sensitisation was done for CECs, students and elders in rural and urban areas.

A monitoring exercise conducted in February 2010 concluded that women and men could mention reasons for sending their daughters to school. Respondents from five target rural villages that participated in the literacy program cited the following reasons:

1. Educated girls would get employment and improve family standards of living.
2. Girls and boys have equal rights to education.
3. To eliminate ignorance.
4. Educated girls would understand their rights.

School enrolment statistics were reported to show that parents are taking both girls and boys to school. In 2011, Nagaad conducted a survey of 21 villages with 7-10 members each. The survey revealed that three of the villages had 30-50 students in each class while 14 villages had more than 50 students in each class. 40% of the students were girls. An FGD conducted for women in the 21 villages showed that women in 10 villages clearly understood the importance of girls' education. The reasons cited were; girls have a right to education, girls' education is allowed by Islam and is a constitutional right and girls' education is incentivised by World Food Programme (WFP) through cooking oil and soap.

In 2012, the project:

- Conducted two outreach awareness on importance of girls' education in the 30 targeted areas. The first was for 904 (500 female, 404 male) and the second for 850 (450 female, 300 male) participants from CEC, management committees and literacy students and teachers.

- Held dialogue forums for village elders and local authorities on how to increase girls’ enrolment in formal schools in the rural areas for 8 mobilisers (3 male, 5 female) and 60 participants (20 female, 40 male) from CECs, management committees and literacy teachers.

The above stimulated girls’ enrollment in formal schools and appreciation of the equality of girls and boys.

Implementers interviewed during the final evaluation indicated that awareness on the importance of girls’ education was given as part and parcel of the literacy project. It is also a venture being actively supported by the MOE which has constructed many formal schools in target villages. All female and male respondents in the FGDs were able to cite at least two reasons for sending girls to school. The responses are summarized in Table 9.

Table 8: Reasons for Supporting Girls’ Education

Male Beneficiaries		Female Beneficiaries	
Yiroowe Village	Ceelbicile Village	Unuunlay Village	Odweyne Village
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is good for personal development: income, exposure and career development. 2. It is good for families: income and improved standards of living. 3. It is good for national development: equity and non-discrimination. 4. It will enable them to breed healthier children when they become mothers. 5. It enables critical thinking and problem solving. 6. It improves the human resource capacity. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. They would make better mothers. 2. It is their right. 3. It improves community standards. 4. Education is key to life. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is their right as equal citizens. 2. It contributes to self development. 3. Enables them to protect the environment. 4. They are part and parcel of the community so should not be discriminated against. 5. They will contribute to community development. 6. They are a source of useful ideas. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. It is their right. 2. To enable them participate in decision making. 3. Parents who missed education are keen to have their daughters benefit. 4. It will make them better mothers.

A male FGD participant in Yiroowe said that “Education is like light while illiteracy is like darkness” while a female respondent in Unuunlay stated that “An illiterate person is like a person who cannot see where s/he is going”.

- *Indicator 2: After completion of the project in 2012 CECs in at least 25% of project villages producing agenda to increase girls' enrolment and/or completion in primary schools.*

In 2010, Nagaad assessed five targeted areas that indicated they had plans to increase girls' enrolment through:

- a) Recruiting female teachers from formal schools.
- b) Interventions to solve problems between teachers and girls.
- c) Having separate classes for girls and boys.
- d) Allowing poor families to enroll their daughters in formal schools free of charge.
- e) Providing learning materials for girls.
- f) Holding more awareness campaigns.
- g) Holding separate trainings for young girls.
- h) Introducing school feeding.
- i) Providing incentives for poor girls.

The 2011 annual report indicates that all five villages surveyed had plans to increase girls' enrolment and completion. But they would use different methods namely: mobilize girls to enrol (one village); sensitise girls to avoid early marriage (three villages); mobilize parents to send their daughters to school (four villages); and all the preceding actions (two villages). But the villages indicating such intentions did not have written plans although they insisted that they kept the plans in their memories. Responses from 17 villages with formal schools indicated that they had agenda to improve girls' education. Education was also seen as part of the government's agenda with MOE actively providing schools with materials specifically to promote girls' education.

During the final evaluation, FGDs conducted in four target villages indicated a general willingness to continue with the literacy component and different sites indicated that they are already doing something about it as follows.

Ceelbicile

- Raising awareness and mobilising parents to send both girls and boys to school.
- Have built a latrine for girls to ensure they are comfortable in school.
- Discouraging school girls from early marriage.

Unuunlay

- Community mobilization to promote enrollment.
- Encouraging girls not to drop out of school.
- Sending own daughters to school.
- Telling other women to send girls to school and the benefits of the same.
- Telling women to seek education which would then make them appreciate the value of girls' education.

Odweyne

- Creating continuous awareness and mobilization for education.
- Taking advantage of the WFP school feeding programme which is specifically targeting girls.
- Riding on the work of Save the Children Fund which is encouraging girls' education.

- Graduates of the programme are organizing meetings with girls to encourage them to go to school.
- Literacy students and graduates meet mothers and urge them to send girls to school.
- Literacy students encourage illiterate adults to enroll in literacy classes.

Yiroowe

- Sending both boys and girls to school.

The findings indicate a variety of steps being taken by different villages to increase girls' enrollment and completion. What the respondents did not indicate was existence of written common community plans with specific assigned actions, time frames and expected results that are being implemented systematically and monitored. Lack of documentation indicates either an oversight by the project or negligence by target villages.

Result 3: Women, men and decision-makers of local communities have increased their knowledge about human rights, including gender equity.

- *Indicator 1: After completion of project in 2012 women in the target communities can name at least 4 reasons supporting women's right to political participation, role in peace-building, right to education, right to property and right to freedom from violence.*

FGDs with women from 21 villages by Nagaad in 2011 established the following picture with regard to reasons for supporting respective women's rights.

Political Participation

- Women from two villages cited that it is granted by Islam.
- Women from five villages cited that women have personal leadership capacity.
- Women from four villages cited that women are part and parcel of the society.
- Women from one village cited that women have equal rights with men.
- Women from nine villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Participate in Peace Building

- Women from four villages cited that it is granted by Islam.
- Women from four villages cited that women have personal leadership capacity.
- Women from three villages cited that women are part and parcel of the society.
- Women from one village cited that women have equal rights with men.
- Women from nine villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Education

- Women from eight villages cited that it is granted by Islam.
- Women from eight villages cited that women have personal intellectual capacity.
- Women from one village cited that women have equal rights with men.
- Women from eight villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Property

- Women from 15 villages cited that it is granted by Islam.

- Women from one village cited that women have equal rights with men.
- Women from five villages cited all the above reasons.

Freedom from Violence

- Women from 13 villages cited that it is granted by Islam.
- Women from one village cited that women have equal rights with men.
- Women from seven villages cited all the above reasons.

Although the findings were not disaggregated enough to indicate whether each woman in the FGDs was able to cite four reasons (which could have been better established through individual rather than group responses), the responses still indicate ability of women to cite specific reasons for supporting specific women's rights.

In 2012, the project:

- Distributed posters on Islam Sharia rights on family affairs, women's rights and personal rights in all 30 targeted villages for the current and previous literacy students.
- Conducted two outreach awareness about gender equality, female genital mutilation and violence against women. The first reached 945 female and 355 male literacy students and rural communities while the second reached 955 female and 375 male literacy students and community members.
- Added basic human rights to the literacy curriculum in teacher training.
- Participated in the celebration of International Women's Day attended by 213 females and 95 males.
- Conducted outreach awareness on importance of maintaining human rights and women's participation for rural and urban communities for 16 mobilizers (10 female, 6 male), drama team (2 female, 3 male), 400 beneficiaries (250 female, 150 male), CECs, management committee and literacy teachers.
- Trained 30 focal persons (20 female, 10 male) from 30 targeted villages to advocate on human rights and gender equality.
- Held a dialogue meeting on human rights and gender equity with 30 male traditional elders.

The above led to increased understanding of basic human rights and gender equality and the absence of women in politics as a kind of discrimination. Women understood their rights to participate in politics and elders accepted women's participation.

FGDs with female beneficiaries of the literacy project in Unuunlay and Odweyne during the final evaluation cited the following reasons in support of women's rights:

1. Men have been tested in leadership and should allow women to show what they can do.
2. Being the primary victims of conflict and violence, women have a responsibility to ensure there is peace.
3. Women have been involved in conflict resolution and have skills to offer.
4. Women are usually more neutral in inter-clan conflicts because of their dual identity.
5. Education enables women to access employment and improve their standards of life.
6. Education improves the quality of women as mothers.

7. Education enables women to manage and improve their vocations.
8. According both women and men their rights creates a more equitable society hence accelerates national development.
9. Violence creates instability.
10. Violence compromises women's health.
11. Women are usually the victims of violence that they have not instigated.

- *Indicator 2: After completion of project in 2012, elders in target committees can justify at least 4 reasons supporting women's right to political participation, role in peace-building, right to education, right to property ownership and right to freedom from violence.*

In 2009, the project held: a two-day dialogue forum in Burao for 100 male clan leaders who agreed to support women's empowerment; two village level and one district level leadership dialogue meetings on women's rights attended by 310 participants (data not disaggregated in report); and regular meetings through 120 CEC members in 30 NFE centres. There were no data collected on this indicator by the project in 2010. Data gathered in 2011 from 21 villages through FGDs revealed the following pattern with regard to elders' ability to identify reasons supporting the various rights.

Right to Political Participation

- Elders from five villages stated that women are part and parcel of society and should not be discriminated against.
- Elders from two villages stated that this right is granted by Islam.
- Elders from two villages stated that women have personal capacity to participate in politics.
- Elders from one village stated that participation is women's human right.
- Elders from one village stated that women have equal rights with men.
- Elders from 10 villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Participate in Peace Building

- Elders from one village stated that women have personal capacity to participate in peace building.
- Elders from six villages stated that peace building is women's human right.
- Elders from five villages stated that it is women's constitutional right.
- Elders from nine villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Education

- Elders from one village stated that education is a constitutional right.
- Elders from 11 villages stated that the right is granted by Islam.
- Elders from one village stated that women have personal capacity to participate in education.
- Elders from two villages stated that women have equal rights with men.
- Elders from six villages cited all the above reasons.

Right to Property

- Elders from 12 villages stated that the right is granted by Islam.
- Elders from three villages stated that women have equal rights with men.

- Elders from six villages cited all the above reasons.

Freedom from Violence

- Elders from 12 villages stated that the right is granted by Islam.
- Elders from three villages stated that women have a basic right to be free from violence.
- Elders from six villages cited all the above reasons.

Significant statistics from the above responses are: elders from 10 villages cited all the four reasons for women’s participation in politics; elders from nine villages cited all the listed reasons in support of women’s right to participate in peace building although the number falls short of the required four reasons; elders from 11 villages cited that women’s education is granted by Islam; elders from 12 villages cited that Islam grants women the right to property; and elders from 12 villages cited that Islam protects women from violence. The citation of religion in support of women’s rights to education, property and freedom from violence is a reassuring foundation considering the strong adherence to religion in the country. On the same score, it is notable that the elders did not cite that religion grants women the right to participate in peace building and only two villages cited that it grants their participation in politics. These could indicate religion-based reservations about women’s place in the public sphere. In October 2012, Nagaad convened 25 elders who endorsed women’s participation in local council elections.

FGDs conducted in the final evaluation with elders confirmed that most elders could cite specific reasons for supporting women’s rights. The evaluation did not disaggregate the number for each of the five rights due to time constraints but posed a general question on elders’ support for women’s rights. The table below tallies the number of elders citing each reason out of a total of seven.

Table 9: Elders’ Reasons for Supporting Women’s Rights

	Reason	Tally
1	Women should be treated equally with men.	7
2	Women can do whatever men can do and sometimes even better.	4
3	Human development is about the collaboration of the two and cannot be achieved if only one is promoted.	7
4	It is a matter of justice and equity.	5
5	Families must be built by both males and females.	7
6	Equitable development benefits the whole community.	7
7	Demographically, women are 60% of the country’s population so they cannot be ignored.	4
8	Women leaders would pay more attention to basic needs because it affects them more.	3
9	Women are part and parcel of the community and should not be discriminated against.	5
10	Women contribute to national development.	5
11	Support for women’s rights is a global trend.	1
12	Women have constitutional rights.	7

The tallies show that each elder could cite at least five reasons supporting women’s rights.

Result 4: Increased knowledge and skills of women who participate in decision-making in local councils, government institutions and community awareness in Togdheer Region.

- *Indicator 1: Course beneficiaries are able to demonstrate at least 3 specific ways in which the courses have helped them in their vocations.*

In 2009, the project submitted a request for training services to Burao University, a pre-training action plan was drafted and selection criteria drafted. The year’s annual report indicates that six partnership agreements were signed with the university and 11 females provided with internships of six months to promote women’s skills training and gainful employment. In 2010:

- 41 females from potential political candidates, civil society and business completed two courses on community development and business administration from Burao University.
- 60 females from different sectors were trained on advocacy and lobbying.
- 10 women staff from line ministries participated in courses at the university.
- Six females from three political parties benefited from university courses and other trainings.
- Four females (2 from local authorities) benefited from training of trainer courses.

In 2011, 35 females completed the six month basic computer training at Burao University. The courses helped the beneficiaries in their vocations, personal roles and responsibilities, problem solving, improved status, career advancement and inter-personal communication. They also benefited in financial management, accounting, reporting and filing. The beneficiaries were so motivated by the courses that they requested to improve their knowledge and skills in order to get diplomas and degrees.

During the final evaluation, eight course beneficiaries were reached with mail questionnaires. All were able to cite at least three ways in which the courses impacted positively on their vocations. The effects cited are summarised in Table 10.

Table 10: Effect of Short Courses on Beneficiaries’ Vocations

	Effect on vocation	Tally
1	Improved office management e.g. filing, recording transactions, financial reporting, administration and communication.	7
2	Improved performance at work place.	4
3	Promotion at place of work.	3
4	Gained community mobilization and development skills.	3
5	Reduced office costs i.e. no longer hires outsider for computer networking.	2
6	Additional qualification.	2
7	Improved proficiency in written and spoken English.	1
8	Familiarity with basic human rights and obligations.	1

The most common effect reported by seven of the eight respondents was improved office management followed by improved performance at work place. It is obvious that the courses had the greatest impact on the professional lives of the beneficiaries.

- *Indicator 2: Course beneficiaries are able to demonstrate 3 specific ways in which courses will enable them to take action to increase women’s participation in decision making.*

Monitoring data by the project established that 75% of beneficiaries had increased awareness of the need for women’s participation and 25% considered that they could advocate for women’s rights to participation. The final evaluation established that course beneficiaries have used the knowledge gained to advocate for women’s rights individually and to campaign for women contesting elections. The latter was energised by Nagaad in October 2012 when it brought together 200 women, among them course beneficiaries, to campaign and vote for female candidates. Virtually all implementers reported that the courses: increased beneficiaries’ knowledge about women’s rights to participate in decision making and politics as voters and candidates; and mobilized beneficiaries to participate in awareness raising activities in support of women contesting the local council elections. The beneficiaries reported in the final evaluation that the courses enabled them to take action in support of women’s participation as summarized in Table 11.

Table 11: Actions by Beneficiaries of Short Courses to Support Women’s Participation

	Action	Frequency
1	Campaign and vote for female candidates.	5
2	Create awareness on women’s rights.	4
3	Mobilise other people, especially women, to vote for women candidates.	3
4	Support and assist women seeking services in government offices e.g. on land issues.	2
5	Mobilize community on violence against women.	1
6	Encourage women candidates.	1

A majority (five) of respondents would campaign and vote for female candidates; four would create awareness on women’s rights; and three would mobilize other people to vote for women. The pattern indicates that the greatest impact with regard to this indicator was to galvanise the course participants’ support for women contesting elections.

- *Indicator 3: Number of effective policies and laws on women's rights that course beneficiaries are exposed to*⁸.

Monitoring data by the project established that 25% of beneficiaries participated in courses related to human rights while 75% did not. All eight beneficiaries of short courses reached in the final evaluation cited that they were exposed to women's rights in the Somaliland constitution while one cited exposure to the Universal Declaration on Human Rights. No other women's rights instrument was cited. The lack of specificity and detail in the responses is taken to indicate that the courses did not give much prominence to this indicator but paid more attention to the professional and career advancement components.

Result 5: Local NGOs in Burao have increased capacity to advocate women's participation in decision-making.

- *Indicator 1: Number of annual coordination meetings held on gender and rights with NGOs, line ministries, traditional elders, grassroots women and other stakeholders.*

Data collected by Nagaad from project partners in 2010 showed that three organizations held annual coordination meetings in the year while the rest only participated in meetings held by other institutions. Those implementers that held coordination meetings focused on their thematic mandates such as human rights, health, education, gender based violence, HIV/Aids and organisational issues. The data showed that stakeholders attending the meetings included line ministries. The agencies reported that the meetings provided publicity and platforms for information sharing on human rights and gender equality.

In 2011, Nagaad interviewed the eight implementers and established that four held annual coordination meetings on gender and human rights attended by LNGOs, line ministers and grassroots women. Four did not hold any such meetings. Nagaad reports that the attendance at meetings organised in Togdheer was dominated by LNGOs. In 2012, the project held an annual workshop for project stakeholders attended by 8 female and 4 male staff from co-implementers, two umbrella organisations, Nagaad and ISF. Due to this, the co-implementers shared information on project implementation, achievements, current state and recommended adjustments.

The final evaluation confirmed that implementers attended monthly coordination meetings over and above other meetings some organised around international events such as International Women's Day when LNGOs came together to carry out joint campaigns. No agency specified the number of annual meetings they held as expected by this indicator, a finding that tends to indicate that the implementers either (mis)construed this indicator to refer to the project's coordination meetings or they did not prioritise this indicator.

⁸ The way this indicator was expressed in the project documents was unclear. The evaluator clarified it with the Programme Coordinator who indicated that course beneficiaries were expected to cover some women's rights instruments.

- *Indicator 2: Number of advocacy initiatives on women's rights implemented.*

Data collected in 2010 by Nagaad established that five of the eight co-implementers conducted advocacy programs on women's rights. The initiatives differed on specific agenda but similar on the objectives to improve protection of women's rights. In 2011, three of the implementers conducted advocacy initiatives once, twice and more than twice respectively. The rest did not hold any advocacy initiatives. And on October 2, 2012, Nagaad convened 25 elders who endorsed that women can compete for any post except that of president. A major advocacy initiative was the pressure for the 25% women's parliamentary quota. It received presidential agreement and was taken to parliament by a committee that considered it appropriate. But it was not passed by parliament. Nevertheless, it established a foundation for further advocacy, including constitutional amendment to provide for affirmative action.

This indicator, like others cited in other parts of the report, is problematic in that just the mere number of initiatives held does not imply positive effect. For instance, had the one initiative on the 25% quota succeeded, it would have had far reaching impacts beyond ten initiatives with less significant impact. In fact, the indicator should have focused on the effect of the initiatives rather than their number.

- *Indicator 3: NGOs operating in Togdheer aware of activities and skills of other NGO in their areas of operation and able to articulate plans for linkage, coordination and information sharing.*

In 2010, the project reported that organizations with similar themes of work held monthly, quarterly and annual coordination meetings. This enabled them to be aware of each other's capacities, activities and areas of operations. However, there were no well articulated plans by the NGOs for linkage, coordination and information sharing. The meetings were largely routine ventures through invitations to individual organizations.

The project reports that in 2011, seven co-implementers had meetings at least once to share on their activities and skills. One did not. All organizations were aware of other organizations' areas of operations. One produced plans for linkages, coordination and information sharing while seven did not. The final evaluation was informed by one regional NGO (SOYDAVO) that it attended one of the LNGO meetings on information sharing on what NGOs do to reduce duplication and conflicts. This indicator seems to overlap with the one on annual coordination meetings and was apparently not given much attention by implementers.

- *Indicator 4: Number of active linkages and or collaborations with specific Diaspora members/organizations that can be demonstrated.*

The 2009 annual report indicates that: three of the eight implementers had linkages with the Diaspora; and Nagaad itself established communication with one Diaspora organization. In 2010, it was reported that five implementers had linkages with the Diaspora based on financial assistance, information sharing and experience sharing. In 2011, the annual report indicated that two of the organizations (unnamed) received funding from Diaspora organizations while two (also unnamed) only engaged in information sharing.

The final evaluation established that Nagaad has contacts with Somali Diasporas in England, Sweden and Norway. The Diaspora is seen as a potential source of funds, ideas and moral support. Some members of Nagaad are actually from the Diaspora. The implementing agencies also had checkered relations with the Diaspora. For SYS, the Somali Teachers Association in the United Kingdom supports the Youth Centre with sports materials and books for the library. It is now planning a big meeting to fund raise to address women's and youth's issues. Relations with the Germany Diaspora are in formative stages following an initial needs analysis. The Italy Diaspora has pledged to support IDP women's health and education through routine health checks and free medicine in two IDP villages. Sabuux shares information with Togdheer Diaspora Association in London but does not receive any financial or material assistance. TWA and Kulmis shares information with individual members in Europe.

Result 6: Acceptance of clan elders' for women to have access to decision-making positions.

Indicator 1: Clan leaders can identify reasons why women should participate in decision making in different levels of society.

In 2010, Nagaad commissioned a study on the attitudes and perceptions of Somaliland's elders on women's participation in national decision-making and political spheres. A questionnaire was administered to 80 elders chosen from the major four towns of Somaliland. 40 in-depth interviews and five FGDs were held with a cross section of selected men in all the targeted towns. This study established that:

- There was an evenly divided support for women with political ambitions. Half of the respondents said they could provide support publicly and convince decision makers to involve more women in politics, while the other half would not do so for fear of a backlash.
- The majority supported women's participation in social and economic spheres.
- All recommended awareness for the whole society, including women, to change public perceptions about women's political participation.
- All supported higher education for women and endorsed the support women's organisations provide to female politicians.

In 2011, Nagaad held an FGD with Togdheer elders to tease out their ability to identify why women should participate in decision making at different levels of society. The reasons cited were that: it is their constitutional right; Islam allows it; it is good for social cohesion; and it promotes gender equality.

In 2012, the project:

- Held a workshop for 50 male elders on the importance of women in decision-making, democratic governance and role of citizens in Burao District.
- Held a workshop for 30 potential women leaders and other active women who envisioned holding decision-making positions in local authorities, government institutions in Togdheer.
- Conducted outreach awareness on: the importance of maintaining human rights and women's participation for 254 females and 149 males in rural and urban communities; and gender equality, FGM and violence against women for 918 (703 female, 215 male) participants. It

also held one through the women's caucus in Burao and Hargeisa attended by 280 male and 320 females.

- Held dialogue meeting on human rights and gender equity with local authorities and political parties bringing together 21 (13 female, 8 male) participants.
- Held lobbying and advocacy meeting for 27 female and 23 male policy makers and political parties/associations on the approval of women's quota
- Conducted civic education (including voter education) for 95 female and 45 males invited from LNGOs, government institutions, IDPs, political parties and women political aspirants.
- Lobbied for women's quota through 19 male and 24 females (elders, religious leaders and government officials).
- Conducted sensitization for 50 male elders and 30 male religious leaders to support women candidates.

Due to the above, there was acknowledgement of the need to accept women's participation in decision making, knowledge on the requirements to contest in elections and electoral procedures, appreciation of obstacles faced by women contesting elections and identification of the need to support women candidates. Religious leaders were reported to have campaigned for women political aspirants.

The final evaluation conducted an FGD with elders who cited the following reasons why women's participation should be supported:

1. Women are human beings.
2. Women can do whatever men can do and sometimes even better.
3. Human development cannot be achieved if one segment of society is ignored.
4. Equitable development benefits the whole community.
5. Women are the majority in Somaliland but this is not reflected in the leadership.

It was clear from the FGD, however, that there is a glass ceiling beyond which women cannot participate. Elders were clear that religion does not allow women to hold the senior-most positions in any structures especially the presidency, judiciary, religion and family. During the final evaluation, Nagaad reported that it influenced local elders to support women's agenda when, on October 2, 2012, it convened 25 elders who endorsed that women can compete for any post except that of president. Implementers reported that elders have accepted that women can participate in village level committees such as health and education. By virtue of participating in these structures, women are able to break into the public limelight and gain confidence.

Indicator 2: Number of meetings between clan leaders and women political aspirants

In 2011, Nagaad reported that three meetings were held between clan leaders and female political aspirants. Two were in the rural areas while one was a strategic planning meeting on women's representation in local councils and parliament. During the final evaluation, SYS reported that through its 2011 leadership training for girls, it invited clan elders to endorse the graduates for leadership and they did. An FGD with elders did not reveal any sustained initiatives around this indicator. Only one elder indicated direct support to a female candidate by endorsing her candidature through a letter to a political party.

Table 12: Summary of Key Activities and Results 2009-2011

2009

- 30 learning centres established (25 in rural villages and five in camps for internally displaced persons (IDPs) in Burao City).
- 22 community mobilizers (13 women and 9 men) were identified from the target villages and trained to conduct awareness campaigns in rural areas.
- Implementing agencies trained on administration and financial management.
- Office equipment distributed to implementing agencies.
- Working relations established between Nagaad, LNGOs and line ministries.
- Qualified teachers identified and recruited from target villages.
- Graduated 1,092 (723 female, 369 male) literacy class students.

2010

- 1,015 (600 female, 415 male) students benefited from literacy courses.
- 41 females from potential political candidates, civil society and business completed two courses on community development and business administration from Burao University.
- 60 females from different sectors were trained on advocacy and lobbying.
- 10 female employees of line ministries participated in courses at Burao University.
- 6 females from three political parties benefited from university courses and other trainings.
- 4 females (2 from local authorities) benefited from TOT courses.
- 100 male clan elders participated in workshops on good governance and women in decision making.
- 30 (8 female, 22 male) literacy teachers were employed.
- 25 (16 female, 9 male) staff from LNGOs, including eight co-implementers, gained knowledge and experience from monitoring literacy sites.
- 4 (2 male, 2 female) project employees were recruited.

2011

- 30 (25 male, 5 female) literacy teachers were trained on adult education methodology, lesson preparation and unit planning.
- 1,452 students (1,035 female, 417 male) graduated from literacy classes.
- 150 (79 male, 71 female) religious leaders, elders, high school, university students and literacy students participated in dialogue forums in high schools and at the University of Burao on how to increase girls' enrolment in formal schools in urban areas and reduce drop out.
- 182 (81 male, 101 female) elders, local authority staff, religious leaders and community members participated in dialogue forums on how to increase girls' enrolment in formal schools in rural areas.
- 69 (27 female, 42 male) members of CECs and village management committees from 30 targeted villages were trained on how to develop plans and produce written agenda for girls' education.
- 60 females intending to contest local elections participated in various workshops.
- 35 females completed the six month basic computer training at Burao University.
- 14 males (traditional elders, Minister of Religion) and 16 females from women's peace associations participated in a two day strategic planning workshop on Togdheer's women's representation in local councils and parliament.
- 16 (11 female, 5 male) staff of 8 co-implementers participated in capacity building training.
- 100 male traditional leaders, religious leaders, chiefs and clan elders participated in a forum on the importance of women in decision-making, democratic governance and the role of citizens.

2012

- Enrolled and registered 1,095 female and 465 male new students.
- Distributed learning stationery to the new students.
- Conducted TOT training for literacy teachers (25 male, 5 female) from the 30-targeted areas.
- Held monthly coordination meetings for the project co-implementers.

- Monitored literacy classes regularly.
- Prepared for the final examination.
- Held final examinations for 1,560 (1095 female, 465 male) students.
- Certified 1,500 (1064 female, 436 male) literacy graduates.
- Conducted outreach awareness on importance of girls education in the 30 targeted areas for 904 (500 female, 404 male) participants and later 850 (450 female, 300 male) participants from CECs, management committees and literacy students and teachers.
- Held dialogue forums for village elders and local authorities on how to increase girls' enrolment in formal schools in the rural areas for 8 mobilisers (3 male, 5 female), 60 participants (20 female, 40 male) from CECs, management committee and literacy teachers.
- Distributed posters for awareness raising on human right focusing on Islam Sharia rights in family affairs, women's rights and personal rights) in all 30 targeted villages for the current and previous literacy students.
- Trained 30 focal persons (20 female, 10 male) from 30 targeted villages to advocate on human rights and gender equality.
- Conducted three outreach awareness about basic human rights: one for 945 female and 355 male literacy students and rural communities; the second for 955 female and 375 male literacy students and community members; and the third for 918 (703 female, 215 male) participants.
- Conducted outreach awareness on importance of maintaining human rights and women's participation for rural and urban communities for 16 mobilizers (10 female, 6male), drama team (2 female, 3 male), 400 literacy beneficiaries (250 female, 150 male), and 254 females and 149 males in rural and urban communities .
- Added basic humans right to literacy curriculum during Teacher's TOT
- Participated in the celebration of International Women's Day attended by 213 females and 95 males.
- Conducted financial workshop for three ISF implementing partners.
- Held annual workshop for project stakeholders attended by 8 female and 4 male staff from co-implementers, two umbrella organisations, Nagaad and ISF.
- Had monitoring visits by one male staff from Hargeisa to Burao and 4 (2 male, 2 female) staff to Hargeisa as well as by 2 females from Nagaad's Board of Directors.
- Held workshop for 50 male elders on importance of women in decision-making, democratic governance and role of citizens in Burao District.
- Conducted civic education (including voter education) for 95 female and 45 males invited from LNGOs, government institutions, IDPs, political parties and women political aspirants.
- Lobbied for women's quota through 19 male and 24 female, elders, religious leaders and government officials.
- Held lobbying and advocacy meeting for 27 female and 23 male policy makers and political parties/associations on the approval of women's Quota
- Conducted outreach awareness through women's caucus in Burao and Hargeisa attended by 280 males and 320 females.
- Held two dialogue meetings on human rights and gender equity: one with local authorities and political parties bringing together 21 (13 female, 8 male) participants; the second for 30 male traditional elders.
- Held workshop for 30 potential women leaders and other active women who envisioned holding decision-making positions in local authorities, government institutions in Togdheer region for 32 (1 male facilitator, 31 female) participants.
- Conducted sensitization for 50 male elders and 30 male religious leaders to support women candidates.
- Held workshop for elders on importance of women in decision-making, democratic governance and the role of citizens attended by 50 male elders in Burao District.
- Monitoring by 2 females from Nagaad's Board of Directors.
- Dialogue forums with clan elders on how to increase acceptance of women in decision making positions for 47 participants (1 male Programme Coordinator, 1 female Project Manager, 45 males).

3.4 External and Organisational Environment

The evaluation sought to establish the external and internal organisational factors that facilitated or constrained the project. The findings are narrated below.

3.4.1 External Facilitating Factors

a. Political Factors

Peace: The prevalence of peace in Somaliland enabled the project to be implemented uninterrupted. The progressive establishment of a working government created stability and buoyed donor confidence to engage with the country.

Democratisation: In 2011, the government allowed new political parties to be registered in addition to the three existing ones. This led to a total of 15 registered political parties nationwide. One of the proposed political parties was led by a woman. Unfortunately, it did not meet the threshold for registration. The registration of new parties has widened the choice for voters, made politics more competitive and multiplied the platforms for women to seek political office. The year also saw the finalisation of the Somaliland National Development Plan for 2012 – 2016 and Somaliland Vision 2030 which provide a road map for the development of the country.

The minimum age for eligibility to contest in local council elections was also revised from 35 to 25 years. This paved the way for youthful candidates to contest and has resulted in many female candidates below 35 years of age entering the race for local council posts.

Affirmative Action: For women, the year 2011 held a lot of promise as the country's president, following up on a pre-election pact signed with Nagaad, established a consultative committee to look into strengthening the political participation of women and minority groups. The decree of September 7, 2011 was based on an appeal submitted by Nagaad on 24th July, 2011 based on Article 8 and 36 of Somaliland's constitution. It requested for affirmative action to boost women's representation in parliament. The committee approved the request but parliament rejected it. This essentially was a reality check for the women's movement on political readiness to take radical action on women's political participation.

Related to this is the fact that the Guurti now has a female member who joined after the death of her husband. Although she was a compromise candidate, she provides a strategic link to an influential structure and is reportedly doing commendable lobbying for women. Her inclusion has also established a precedence that can be built upon to advocate for the hitherto exclusive male structure to be opened up to women.

Local Council Elections: In view of the local council elections originally slated for April 2012, the project carried out an assessment on the potential participation of women. This was in the backdrop that there were only two women out of the 285 seats in local government, a total disgrace considering that women constitute the majority demographically. Nagaad dispatched data collectors to different regions. One group covered Maroodijeex and Awdal regions while another covered Sahil, Sanaag, Togdheer and Sool. The first group established that there were six potential female candidates from different political parties including those newly announced. The second group established that women had potential interest in contesting the elections. In Erigavo and Burao, there were actually women eyeing both local and parliamentary elections.

b. Social Factors

The government's free education policy came into effect from the beginning of 2011. This stimulated the enrollment of girls at all levels. This development got a morale booster when girls, for the first time in Somaliland, topped the national examination results for both secondary and primary schools. A second booster was that the MOE employed 1,500 teachers (1,100 male and 400 female). This increased the number of female teachers in the country and is regarded as a possible stimulant of increased girls' enrolment.

3.4.2 External Constraining Factors

a. Political Factors

Rejection of Quota: At the end of 2011, the project logframe was revised to incorporate lobbying for the 25% quota for women in parliament based on the promise by Kulmiye Party during the 2010 presidential elections. ISF gave funding towards this new activity. However, parliament in July 2012 rejected the quota reportedly based on the argument that the constitution guarantees equality for women and men, quotas were only allowed for minorities and women did not constitute a minority hence granting the quota would be unconstitutional unless the constitution was amended. This dampened the women's movement and pushed it back to the drawing boards.

Postponed Elections: The local council elections that were slated for April 2012 were postponed to November 2012 due to slow registration of new political parties. As a result, the project deferred several activities related to the elections. So it did more awareness creation, lobbying for policy changes and outreach to elders. The following activities were canceled and replaced.

1. Media campaigns, debates and public discussions on women's rights to participate in local council elections.
2. Recruitment of a project assistant,
3. Public awareness on women's participation in the local council elections.
4. One day forum for women candidates on how to unite and collaborate during campaigns.
5. Workshop on campaign management and collaboration for targeted urban and rural candidates.
6. Training of 50 campaigners for women candidates.
7. One media dialogue for religious leaders to publicly endorse women's rights to be elected in Islamic settings.
8. One training for advocacy and lobbying for Togdheer women LNGOs.
9. Two trainings for Togdheer women political spirants on political leadership skills, advocacy, lobbying, public speaking and campaign management.
10. One meeting with traditional elders (chiefs, suldans, elders) to support women candidates.
11. One media dialogue with clan elders.

The above situation limited the assessment of impact of the project on women's success in local elections

At another level, the 2010 presidential elections led to diversion of those attending literacy classes to campaigns. The same effect has been felt with regard to current campaigns for local elections.

Insecurity: There was a lingering fear of the militant Al Shabaab leading to security arrangements that barred public meetings and rallies hence project limitations to convene awareness raising sessions. There were also inter-clan conflicts which diverted women from project activities to conflict resolution to ensure that the country did not relapse into war and instability. There were also constant flows of refugees from Somalia to Somaliland due to the instability in the former.

Collaboration: The project experienced some hiccups in working with the government and political parties. Some government ministries were slow in providing information and suffered frequent staff turnovers which meant that the project was frequently dealing with different individuals. The political parties presented a major challenge in their response to invitations to project activities. They routinely ignored the invitations and presented a facade of being very busy. Many of them are new and so are going through formative challenges.

B. Environmental Factors

Drought: The key constraint to the literacy programme was recurrent drought. In 2010, for instance, a severe drought led to massive migration of people in search of water and pasture that left some villages empty. This interfered with class sizes and the school calendar. This meant that teachers had fluctuating workloads (too little when people migrated and too much when they returned). Teachers then had to assess the proficiency levels to determine where to place returnees. This meant separating those with low and high competencies and conducting remedial classes. In the end, some beneficiaries had a delayed completion time.

The offshoot was that communities expected the project to address their practical needs (water especially), which were not part of the project mandate. Inability to respond could lead to loss of confidence in the project. This created the risk of being maligned as irrelevant, abstract and insensitive. In one instance, the project was able to negotiate with Save the Children Fund to provide water for a village benefiting from the literacy programme.

Droughts and food insecurity made campaigns for gender equality sound insensitive to people's plight (you cannot teach people on an empty stomach). In such cases, there were limited audiences at forums and low levels of attention by those in attendance. In fact, such instances created ethical dilemmas for implementers in that they could not possibly continue with the programme oblivious of the practical suffering the villagers were going through. The project did damage control by explaining its mandate. However, such explanations do not address the survival need.

Accessibility: The project experienced occasional challenges with access to rural communities as a result of impassable roads during rains and long distances to some villages. Sometimes staff got stranded and lost valuable time. There were also some villages with no shelters where staff could stay overnight hence necessitating long travel back to Burao.

b. Social Factors

Division of Labour: Women attending classes were often diverted to traditional chores of tending cattle and catering for families. This is what informed the holding of classes in the afternoons when the animals would be resting under shades. Men also absented themselves when there were income earning opportunities (such as cutting grass for use to feed livestock on transit to Saudi Arabia) or when they had to go looking for lost livestock. Many also absented themselves to go for *khat*-chewing sessions where they discussed communal issues such as conflicts.

Community Expectations: One dimension of this was that each village was scrambling to be included in the project. Thus there was a lot of lobbying including visits to the Nagaad office in Burao to influence inclusion. Another dimension is that the project has stimulated appetite for literacy and additional skills as evidenced by demands from products of the project and adjoining villages.

In some cases, communities pegged their expectations of the project on what other agencies were doing. So if these agencies were giving out tangible items, communities demanded the same of the project. A case was cited where villagers migrated to a neighbouring village where an agency was distributing relief food.

Resistance: There was some initial skepticism about what women would benefit from the literacy programme. The poor prioritization of education also created initial inertia in recruitment of literacy class participants. The project addressed this through awareness creation and mobilisation using community level entry points.

A persistent challenge was that of reluctance to accept women's participation in the public sphere. This originated from the patriarchal belief in men's leadership and women's subordination. The FGD with elders indicated that even if community leaders support women, there is no guarantee that they will triumph in elections due to other variables, the main one being the strong allegiance to clans as women are considered to be having a double identity.

c. Economic Factors

The consumer price index increased, the exchange rate against hard currencies fluctuated and income tax increased from 6% to 12%. This adversely affected purchasing power and standards of living standard. It heightened levels of poverty and dependency.

3.5 Project Relevance

The central question posed on this issue was whether the project focused on the felt needs of the community. It was established that the project was founded on a needs assessment and baseline study which identified literacy, formal education, economic empowerment and political and civil rights as the key needs. These were tallied with ISF programme principles and focus and

Nagaad’s competence to arrive at the project components. On this score alone, the project was deemed relevant.

The evaluation still sought to establish whether implementers and beneficiaries thought that this relevance remained throughout or whether other over-riding needs arose that should have been addressed.

There was unanimity from all respondents that the project was relevant and effective. The needs addressed remained and still remain relevant because: levels of illiteracy are still very high; women’s participation in decision making is still very low; and the demand for professional skills and higher formal education is high. In deed the link between literacy and women’s empowerment was clear in the responses on what needs were addressed as summarized in table 13.

Table 14: Beneficiaries’ List of Needs Addressed

Literacy	Women’s Rights	Short Courses
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved women’s literacy. • Dispelled notion that older people cannot read and write hence closed up inter-generational disparities. • Enabled women to participate in forums requiring literacy and compete for positions requiring literacy e.g. teaching. • Improved beneficiaries’ ability to manage their vocations. • Reduced exploitation by fraudsters. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Opened up public space for women. • Increased women’s participation in decision making at family and villages levels. • Motivated women to contest in local elections. • Enhanced recognition of women’s right to political participation, decision making, education, property ownership, freedom from violence and peace building. • Created awareness that women have similar rights with men. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improved knowledge on: community development; business administration; office management and report writing. • Improved English language proficiency. • Galvanized support for women’s rights and women contesting elections.

The two most significant changes were identified as the sense of empowerment provided by literacy and the increasing recognition and acceptance that women and men have equal rights in the private and public domains. Literacy is considered as a gateway to formal education and an enabler in terms of improving access to ideas and information. Through this, the project contributed to the national aspiration that by 2015 no one in Somaliland should be illiterate. Thus the two components were not only relevant but inter-connected. The sense of relevance and impacts of the literacy component are vivified in the anecdote and testimonies below.

Anecdote: The Insolent Letter Writer

There was a woman who used to send a fellow village woman to a trader in the town to supply her with goods. The benefactor once got tired and instead of writing the usual correct letter, she wrote an insolent letter to the supplier who was so surprised by the turn of events he stopped sending the supplies. When the woman in the village followed up, the supplier informed her he could not tolerate the insults in the letter “she” sent him. The woman discovered what had happened and decided to enroll for literacy classes so she did not have to depend on a go-between to write her letters.

Narrated by SOYVO.

Testimonies of Female Beneficiaries in Unuunlay Village

Shopkeeper: I can order supplies directly without involving a third party. So my communication is accurate and not distorted.

Butcher: I slaughter animals and supply meat to the city and the village. I used to experience losses because I could not trace all those I supplied or to calculate the value of my meat. Now I can calculate my profits and losses.

Young woman: I can check whether packed foods like soft drinks are expired or not. (She practically did on a bottle of water during FGD).

Testimonies of Female Beneficiaries in Odweyne Village

Businesswoman: I record my sales, earnings, loans, repayment and prices of my goods.

Housewife: I collect 10 dollars per month from every woman participating in the village Merry-Go-Round scheme. I get a commission for this. I am able to keep accurate records because of literacy.

Khat seller: I record all phone numbers of credit customers so I can follow up and not lose income. Literacy has helped me to improve my debt collection.

Clothes seller: I record my purchases and sales of clothes and shoes. So I know my debtors.

Tea seller: I am able to help my children with their homework. We sit and learn together.

Testimonies of Male Beneficiaries in Yiroowe Village

Hotelier: It enables me to monitor the foods popular with customers and what to prioritize in my menu.

Young man: I am able to read signboards and written news.

Casual labourer: I collect and sell building stones to the city. I am able to calculate the number of lorries I have loaded, what earnings I expect, the advances received and the balances. This reduces suspicions between me and my creditors.

Water vendor: The education has enabled me to record the amount of water supplied to each household and my expected payments.

Unemployed youth: Literacy has enabled me to write letters to my parents without involving a third party. This way I keep my family affairs secret.

Khat seller: Before, I had a lot of conflicts with people who had taken my stock but were not willing to pay the right amount. Now I record the agreed amount when I sell so they pay without

complaining.

Testimonies of Male Beneficiaries in Ceelbicile Village

Farmer: I am able to work out how much I have produced, write to my customers the quantity of potatoes I have sent them and make orders of sugar without relying on a second party as I used to do before.

Farmer: I used to pay other people to write letters for me to my customers. Now I write the letters myself and save the money. I can also calculate advances I have been paid and the balances so there are fewer conflicts between me and my creditors.

Livestock farmer: I keep camels and sell milk to Burao. There is a lady who receives and sells the milk for me. She also sends me other supplies such as rice. Now I am able to record the amount of milk I have sent her and the value of supplies she has sent me in order to determine who owes the other. Writing has helped me to verify these transactions.

Khat seller: I am able to calculate the number of bags of *khat* I have taken from the suppliers and the people I have supplied on credit

The major misgiving with regard to the project's relevance was related to its inability to respond to the emerging practical livelihood needs of the communities. Main issues pointed out were: access to water and pasture during dry seasons; poor hygiene and sanitation in communities; and lack of maternity services for women. Among beneficiaries of the short courses, the needs they would have liked to be met include: provision of micro finance credit to businesswomen; income generating activities for project beneficiaries; English language courses; and further formal education leading to degrees. They also considered the course duration to be too short and the coverage geographically limited considering the expanse of Togdheer Region.

3.6 Project Efficiency

The evaluation sought to assess the use of project resources in relation to the achievements. Respondents were therefore asked whether they thought the project achieved more with little resources, little with more resources or there was a perfect match between resources and achievements.

The unanimous response from Nagaad and all the implementing agencies was that the achievements outweighed the resources. Rahim Abdilahi of TWA summarises this sentiment when he says: "We can get the money but the value of education is higher than that of the money because education remains in the community". Reasons advanced for this sentiment were that:

- Many needy villages and large populations were reached.
- The project shared meagre logistical resources (one vehicle for nine agencies) but still managed to cover all the areas.

- The project had a lean staffing structure compared to the workload and geographical expanse. For instance, some thought that because the project consisted of two distinct components (literacy and advocacy), it should have at least had an educational specialist at par with an advocacy specialist. Both functions were covered by one project manager.
- The advocacy materials produced are reusable and hence will cut down future costs.
- Because of Nagaad's track record on gender issues and the availability of implementers based in Togdheer and conversant with the geographical and socio-cultural terrain, the project was rolled out promptly and did not face any significant social difficulties.
- The regular monitoring ensured smooth implementation and decision making on adjustments. Reports were also submitted in time.
- There was full attention to the project by the Burao staff as it was the only project being implemented.

Additionally, it is observed that:

- The project tackled a diversity of key factors relating to the status of women and girls in Somaliland. Although literacy and short professional courses were the entry points, the project snowballed into larger by-products of empowerment as revealed in the use of literacy by beneficiaries in their vocations and personal lives and the conviction of beneficiaries of short courses to support women's political participation.
- The implementers demonstrated a lot of conviction and passion partly born out of patriotism but also catalysed by a desire to perform to their best. They thus provided additional resources in terms of focal points and internal supervisors who were not paid by the project.

The key strengths which ensured efficiency were: project relevance, Nagaad's stature and organisational systems, capacity building for implementers, timely disbursement of funds and other resources, clear division of labour and effective coordination. But there were also challenges.

First, the project focused on its mandate and was unable to respond to the livelihood challenges facing the target communities especially water and pasture during droughts that tend to recur particularly in October. The typical responses were to withdraw from severely affected villages which had migrated and to wait for the communities to return before the project activities could continue. The first response implies that some targeted villages eventually missed out on the benefits of the project due to factors beyond their control or that of the project. The second response implies that teachers had fluctuating workloads.

Second, the issue of over-reliance on the donor for supervision and advice is a lapse that should have been firmly dealt with during the duration of the project. It points out a weakness from both the parties in one fulfilling its expected role in the project and the other in insisting on delivery of the terms of reference. This would have been done by mandated attendance of planning activities and adherence to clearly stipulated monitoring and back-up missions by Nagaad headquarters.

Third, the staffing complement, although based on the original project plan, should have been reviewed at least by the end of the first year to address gaps related to:

- workload (project manager straddling two big functions – education and advocacy - and with no assistant);
- division of labour to reduce accountability risks (combination of finance and administration);
- field presence;
- provision of payment for focal points and rent for teaching venues;
- provision of an additional project vehicle to ensure more regular field monitoring visits and a back-up should one vehicle be broken down; and

While the uniform provision of resources to co-implementers minimized conflicts and competition, the fact that the agencies had different capacities suggests that they should not have been treated similarly with regard to capacity building. In which case, there could have been a stratified capacity needs assessment of the agencies so that those with higher capacity constraints should have had additional assistance with regard to infrastructure (e.g. creation of functional websites) and human resources.

Considering that these weaknesses did not create major upsets in the implementation of the project, limited resources were used to cover large populations and reach many sites, and the benefits gained are long term in nature, the evaluation concludes that the project was satisfactorily efficient.

3.7 Sustainability of Impacts

The evaluation sought to establish how sustainable the development impacts can be considered to be and assess existing factors that can sustain the project impacts without any external support.

The annual reports highlight various aspects of sustainability. First, the project started off on the understanding that communities would continue once the project came to an end. Clues regarding were reported as:

- Development of plans by some rural villages to mobilise finances from community members, pay for or offer venues and have teachers volunteer their services.
- Continuous awareness on the importance of literacy, girls' education and women's right using the skills gained from training on advocacy and lobbying.

The 2009 annual report notes, however, that the willingness to continue with the literacy project was compromised by poverty and droughts. Most communities depend on livestock which die in large numbers due to drought unless communities migrate to wetter areas. The lack of diversified sources of livelihoods makes communities extremely unstable.

Second, the knowledge, skills and experiences gained by the project staff and implementing partners would remain with them and be used. Third, LNGOs would utilise their linkages and those with Somali Diasporas to advocate for women's rights. Their passion would also continuously propel them to sustain the project. But institutional sustainability would be affected by two factors. First is educational level. On the one hand, the literacy gained would encourage

quest for higher education. On the other side, those who do not pursue higher levels will be stunted and left frustrated and unfulfilled. Second is remuneration of teachers. The success of the project reportedly spurred other donors to start similar activities in the region which resulted in poaching of teachers hence loss of capacity as well as the project's financial investment in training them. To sustain the teaching force would thus mean offering wages that are comparable to or better than those offered by the other agencies. Increased demands of teachers would also result in an automatic hiking of salaries demanded by qualified teachers which would inflate project costs or render it inefficient.

Fourth, the knowledge would be self-propelling. Literacy and numeracy would not only remain with the direct beneficiaries but also be transferred to their children. It would also stimulate demand for similar services. The technical skills gained by those attending courses at the University of Burao would benefit them in their personal lives and vocations and be utilised to promote women's rights and national development. They would assist women gain employment and status as well as claim their own rights. And the discussion on the root causes of gender equality would not just die down but continue. This would spur rational thinkers to revise their attitudes and opinions.

Fifth, modern information communication technology would sustain information sharing and be used as a communication and awareness raising tool.

The final evaluation confirmed the above suppositions but also examined a variety of factors considered relevant for sustainability. The findings on these variables are reported below.

3.7.1 Financial Sustainability

There were mixed responses with regard to the availability of financial resources for the project to continue. Some key respondents and implementing agencies were rather pessimistic about chances of sustenance without external funding because there would be no certainty of running the programme for any reasonable period. However, they felt that communities can contribute in kind (land and building materials) and the government can train teachers to run the classes.

Of primary interest was the ability of Nagaad to continue the project without external funding. For this to happen, it would need a sustainability strategy that is implemented and generating income. It would also require an exit strategy for every project implemented. The evaluation established that Nagaad has a written strategy to raise funds for the organization but it is not yet fully implemented. Its only source of income apart from donor funding are membership fees. Its exit strategy is to have project beneficiaries and communities take over the responsibility of running the project.

Nagaad fully relied on the donor funds for the project. The level of funding for Nagaad is generally dependant on the global economic health and strength of donors. But part of the Nagaad sustainability strategy is to use collections from member organizations to run operations in Somaliland when external funds get exhausted. There was no indication, however, of how substantial the collections are and the extent to which they can run Nagaad programmes. But Nagaad thinks it should pursue local fundraising e.g. from businesses in the country.

Respondents from local communities indicated that some villages had literacy and formal education classes that can continue to be used. Additionally, they can contribute by: donating venues for classes, charging minimal rents or constructing classes; raising funds to pay teachers' fees and procure educational materials; levying taxes on business people; having teachers volunteer their services; and recycling those who have gained from the literacy classes into teaching. The Ceelbicile group was particularly confident and indicated their resolve by pointing out a site they are excavating for water storage to sustain the literacy classes.

However, community contribution is likely to be severely limited by economic reality and levels of poverty. Thus the willingness to make the required contributions cannot necessarily be matched with the actual ability to do so. The nomadic lifestyle itself would make mobilization of resources difficult. Asked whether they cannot sell livestock, the reply was that there is no viable local livestock market.

3.7.2 Social Sustainability

Volunteerism: Given that movements are driven by passion and commitment to a cause, the evaluation sought to establish whether volunteerism can be used to sustain the project. Nagaad thinks so and cites that education committees, teachers, mobilisers and focal points can continue volunteering their services. Other respondents also pointed out that this is possible.

However, there is need for caution and to avoid mistaking volunteerism with engagement in a service due to lack of an alternative or in anticipation of a future opportunity. If people volunteer their services for these reasons, then it is obvious that they would decamp as soon as a paid opportunity comes up elsewhere and run out of steam should no internal opportunities come up. The volunteerism would thus be a conditional one that cannot be relied upon. One respondent felt that in the context of the harsh climatic and economic environment, it is rationally difficult to expect people to work for free. This respondent did not think that volunteerism is a traditional practice in Somaliland and that the average person expects to be paid for services.

Successor Generation of Young Women: The evaluation sought to establish whether there are strategic steps being taken to create a successor generation of principally young women who can continue the quest for gender equality from the middle-aged women currently doing so. It was established that some efforts have been invested towards this. In the first week of October, Nagaad convened 200 university students to campaign and vote for women candidates in the local elections. As well, Nagaad sponsors 20 young women annually at Hargeisa University's Faculty of Law. This year, it actually sponsored six more by virtue of contributions from its staff members. It also supports young women to pursue short courses at Burao University hence improve their vocations and become role models as well as advocates for gender equality. One key informant was categorical that "young people can create change" and was wondering why Nagaad does not have younger women in its Board of Directors to groom them for succession. It appeared to this informant that the entrenchment of gerontocratic leadership in the women's movement is keeping younger women at the periphery and preventing them from learning the ropes. Some beneficiaries of the short courses were of the opinion that increase in girls' enrolment will elevate women's status in the long run.

Contributions of Religious Leaders: Religious leaders averred that they have a significant role in Somaliland. Thus they can contribute to sustainability by educating the public on religious canons on women's rights, actively participating in debates and dialogues on gender issues and being role models of gender equality in their own lives. Unfortunately, the evaluator thought that religious leaders' support for gender equality is more rhetorical, academic and politically correct than practical. In an FGD for seven of them, only one categorically stated that he supported a female candidate by giving her an endorsement letter to take to a political party. The rest were general in their responses. Two key informants also felt that religious leaders and elders are not doing much outside workshops and most are just paying lip service to gender equality.

Contributions of Community Elders: Elders are also influential in Somaliland because they are the ones that guide their clans on political choices. It was clear even from women contesting elections that unless they get the support of clan leaders, their chances of success are very limited. Respondents indicated that community elders can contribute to sustainability by promoting gender equality through: personal change in attitude; public sensitisation through meetings, public speeches and mass media; and campaigning for women seeking decision making positions. Again, the evaluation did not establish any palpable and convincing support from the leaders to women's participation and gender equality.

Advocacy and Lobbying: Respondents from local communities indicated that they can contribute to sustaining the project by advocacy and sensitisation for attitude change on women's political participation, girls' education and gender equality.

3.7.3 Technical Sustainability

Expertise on Gender Issues: Nagaad has access to educated women, gender equality activists, school teachers and member organisations that can provide gender expertise. However, it is not conceived that this expertise would come free or cheap hence this site is not guaranteed for sustainability.

Community Structures: One measure of sustainability considered was the evolution of other organisations as a direct result of the project. The argument is that this would multiply the number of actors and hence reduce the workload as well as expand coverage and improve the quality of services provided. The response to this question was that the project has led to the formation of CECs in the villages. Some villages have educational boards that are planning for the future. The project has also formed teams of community mobilizers to advocate for women's rights and recruited and trained human rights focal points in all the 30 target villages. Respondents also indicated that there are village level mobilisation techniques that can be used to get people to rally around a common cause.

Somaliland Civil Society: Some respondents indicated that the expanding civil society in Somaliland is a good development for sustainability as the actors can pick up elements of the project and replicate them in different parts of the country.

Utilisation of Literacy Products: Many respondents felt that the young beneficiaries of literacy will replicate awareness among their peers and that all cadres of beneficiaries can be recycled

into the project as teachers, mobilisers and advocates of equality; they can also upgrade their skills hence advance their careers and act as role models.

Self-propulsion: Several respondents were of the opinion that some aspects of the project are self-propelling. First, the high demand for education will create pressure on MOE to open up educational institutions and services. Second, the understanding of the value of girls' education and women's rights is established in people's minds and cannot be erased so women and girls will continue to claim their rights. Third, the literacy and numeracy gained remains with the beneficiaries.

3.7.4 Political Sustainability

Nagaad-Government Relationship: The current relationship is good both with line ministries and the top political leadership at regional and national levels. The Regional Governor has even awarded Nagaad a certificate of recognition for its work in Togdheer Region. The MOE is a key stakeholder and was instrumental in selecting needy villages, supervision and certification of those completing literacy classes. Being the primary duty bearer with regard to education in the country, the ministry has the onus to continue with literacy programme with or without donor funding. On this score, the government could take over the literacy project. However, considering the country's level of economic development and the vast developmental needs, it is not likely that the government would fulfill this responsibility to the optimum. One key informant felt that although Nagaad enjoys a good relationship with the government, it is not very strategic and focused in its lobbying to attract the maximum possible support. This informant noted that many lobbying events end up being mere public relations exercises at which no substantive gains are made.

Commitment of Political Parties: There was no concrete evidence that any of the political parties has a proactive ideology and plans to deliberately and systematically promote gender equality in its structures and programmes. None of the seven political parties interviewed were able to produce a gender policy which would demonstrate this commitment although all were quick to point the number of women running on their tickets. They are also all constrained by the national consensus of a glass ceiling for women's leadership.

Experience and Career: All categories of respondents believed that the gains made in terms of more women coming out to contest augur well for the future in that: candidates are gaining valuable experience for use in the future even if they do not win now; the candidates contesting are likely to be career politicians; the candidates are creating new role models for girls; the political space will continue expanding and provide options for women; and knowledge about non-discrimination would spur support for women.

The evaluator's conclusions on sustainability are as follows.

1. The desire for literacy has been instilled and is likely to spur some communities to take action at village level to continue it. But the number of such villages is likely to be severely limited by lack of resources to put up structures, acquire educational materials and particularly pay teachers. In fact, the sustenance of a teaching force is primary to the

initiatives. The efforts will certainly be negatively affected by droughts and hence migration which will imply that when communities return, they would have to divide their resources between re-establishing themselves and funding the literacy project. Thus only a minority of villages may actually have meaningful initiatives. In short, without meaningful financial resources, the project will not continue. Either a new donor is found or the MOE takes over and continues the project in target villages or markets the successes of this project to other donors.

2. The existence of community committees established by the project is useful for sustainability because they are already organised and have been equipped with some skills. But they can only be useful if they have something to do and resources with which to do it. Unless their motivation is maintained, they are likely to just peter off. Their survival will largely depend on the availability of funds so that their main role is community mobilization and planning.
3. The greatest impact that is likely to spin off from the literacy component is support for girls' education. The female beneficiaries of the literacy component are seen as reliable ambassadors of this cause. The appreciation of girls' education by even other respondents such as elders augurs well for the future. And the free education policy is a strong catalyst for this to be achieved.
4. The knowledge and literacy gained are self-propelling in that they will be used by the beneficiaries and assist with the education of beneficiaries' children. The technical skills gained by those attending short courses are already benefiting them in their personal lives and vocations and is being utilised to promote women's rights. And the discussion on gender equality will certainly continue especially in the context of more women contesting political positions. Considering the difficulty in changing entrenched beliefs, massive change will not be realised overnight but the seed of discussion has been planted.
5. Volunteerism in pushing forward the literacy and gender equality agenda is noble. But it will also be constrained by material conditions of life and can only be sustained by availability of basic needs for the volunteers. In the context of the harsh climatic and economic conditions in Somaliland, this option is not very viable.
6. The steps being taken by Nagaad to sponsor young women's higher education, broaden the scholarship beyond Hargeisa and recruit young women into campaigning for female politicians are commendable. But their scale is not large enough to create quick impact. There is also no discernible clear programme of mentorship for young women through the civil society to quickly establish a cadre of young female activists. Unless such programmes are initiated and taken up by the women's CSOs, the women's movement will still have miniature strides towards creating a critical mass of young women campaigning for gender equality and asserting their rights.
7. Religious leaders and clan elders are and will continue to be significant actors with regard to promoting gender equality. They can and should therefore not be ignored. But current strategies of engaging with them are not very effective and so their contribution is minimal. Unless the engagement strategies are revised, there is no fundamental impact that will be realised from them.

8. Political parties provide another critical site for advocacy to promote women's political participation. Currently, there is no reason to believe that they will adopt this agenda aggressively. It is certain that they will not invest in women who are not strong enough candidates to put forward a serious challenge, they are constrained by belief in the clan system and many of them are still very new and hence are grappling with establishing themselves structurally. The last factor is not necessarily a liability and could be turned into an asset by working with them to see the promotion of women's participation as a niche that can gain them popularity among womenfolk.
9. Considering the obstacles faced by women contesting the local council elections, it should not be hoped that majority of them will win the seats they are contesting. While hoping for the best, the elections should be seen more as a testing ground for accumulation of experience and practical lessons that can be used in future to sustain the current crop of contestants, motivate more women to contest and develop strategies on how to make the contestants more formidable. It is encouraging that virtually all the contestants interviewed indicated that they will contest future elections (local and parliamentary) even if they lose this one.

3.8 Capacity Building

One of the principles of ISF funding is to build the capacity of its partners. The evaluation therefore sought to establish what capacities the implementing agencies and Nagaad gained from the project. The following was established.

3.8.1 Implementers

- a) *Resources:* The project distributed eight printers and desktop computers (one for each agency) and two photocopiers for the two umbrella organisations. This made project reporting and documentation effective and efficient. As a result, quality reports were submitted and implementers appreciated the value of regular monitoring and reporting. The equipment remains with the agencies for continued use. The administrative costs provided (US\$150 per month) also enabled the implementers to run the project with stability and without undue stress.
- b) *Training:* All agencies involved received training on monitoring and evaluation, financial management, advocacy and lobbying, community mobilisation, proposal writing and project planning and management. Many of the implementers averred that they can now write funding proposals and have vastly improved in their ability to compile project and donor reports. The skills remain available to the agencies and contribute to better management and higher productivity of other projects.
- c) *Experience:* LNGOs gained experience from implementing the project. Some got exposed for the first time to running projects in rural areas. This opened up new frontiers for them and improved their profiles and competitiveness for future funding. This capacity can be used in future endeavours.
- d) *Cooperation:* The agencies developed synergy and earned greater inter-agency cooperation. The resulting network is a potential collective force for education that can be used by the

MOE to sustain impetus for literacy in Somaliland, raise resources and do collaborative work with bigger impact than when done by singular organisations. For instance, training of teachers can be collectivised to reduce costs for each agency. The collaboration enabled implementers to learn from one another. Exposure to bigger organisations enabled the smaller ones to learn aspects of project management through information sharing forums and physical visits.

3.8.2 Nagaad

- a) *Resources*: The project provided a project vehicle, running costs and office equipment which made monitoring, reporting and documentation effective, efficient and professional. The installation of a new financial system improved financial reporting and efficiency and enabled the financial staff to learn a new package. The funding also ensured that Nagaad's Buraq office remained operational and visible. It also means that Nagaad could use its regional presence to conduct training for its membership without having to take them to Hargeisa.
- b) *Training*: Nagaad received training on monitoring and evaluation, financial management, advocacy and lobbying, community mobilisation, proposal writing and project planning and management.
- c) *Experience*: Nagaad gained experience in programme development from inception to implementation, coordination of multiple actors and running a literacy programme.
- d) *Outreach*: The project enabled Nagaad to work with grassroots communities and provide much needed services. This contributed to its national visibility and amplification of voices for gender equality. In the view of Nagaad's Executive Director, implementing this project enabled Nagaad to break from being an apex to a grassroots organisation.
- e) *Cooperation*: The project strengthened Nagaad's relationship with the implementers and established a foundation for future collaboration.

3.9 Previous Evaluation

The evaluation sought to establish whether and how Nagaad has built in the recommendations of the previous evaluation. This helps to measure how serious it takes evaluations and the ability to improve its projects. The findings were as follows against each recommendation.

- *Broaden focus not just to member organizations, but all Somaliland women.*

31 members of Nagaad are based in Hargeisa while 15 are in the regions. These organisations carry out education on Islamic law towards women's political participation. Nagaad is also linked to regional organisations in the Horn of Africa.

- *Move from implementing to advising and delegating more to member organizations.*

Nagaad has established a common funding pot from which it distributes resources to members. It holds an annual general meeting at which members receive advice. Nagaad also builds the capacity of its members on women's rights and disseminates calls for proposals to members.

- *Strengthen links with other umbrellas and more coordination in distributing and producing materials.*

Nagaad is a member of the Somaliland Non State Actors Association which made a press statement after parliament rejected the 25% quota for women.

- *Recruit more young people- especially girls - and give more support to youth associations.*

Nagaad mobilised 200 young women from universities to campaign for female candidates in the local elections.

- *Involve more men, especially in advocacy, pressure groups etc.*

The Board of Directors has two men out of seven members. There are 10 male and 8 female staff in Hargeisa and 2 female and 4 male staff in Burao. The project also involved men in literacy classes and targeted elders and religious leaders to advocate for women's rights.

- *Better relationship with government to avoid antagonism over resources.*

Nagaad is currently enjoying a cordial relationship with the government at both national and regional levels because of close collaboration with line ministries and access to top political leadership. The government itself recognises Nagaad as a credible organisation and the woman's organisation of choice.

- *Work with media.*

"This is the gun we use", states Nagaad's Executive Director. Nagaad extensively uses government and private media and relies on international media particularly the Horn Cable Television and websites.

- *Need regional committees to reach the grassroots and neighbourhood organisations and open regional offices.*

In 2011, Nagaad established the Erigavo Regional Office and women's peace coalitions in 15 villages in Erigavo. The new office involves women in conflict resolution and peace building since the area is prone to inter-clan conflicts which fuel gender based violence and other negative effects on women. The peace coalitions particularly use folklore to promote peace. Nagaad is planning to establish offices in the other five regions of Somaliland but the pace will be dictated by funding.

- *Organize exposure visits between Hargeisa and regions so Hargeisa organisations can see what regions are doing.*

This has not yet been done but Nagaad recognises that it is necessary and can be done through the regional offices.

- *Set up a leadership institute to create a support-base for a women's political movement with the following elements: improved TOT courses, Resource Centre, Advocacy Advice Bureau for Gender and Political Rights and university scholarships.*

Nagaad has a big resource centre in Hargeisa that university students rely on. There is women's activism in Hargeisa. Forums are organised at which students are mentored. In 2012, Nagaad

provided scholarships to 26 girls at Hargeisa University. This was six more than it had planned. The resources to sponsor the additional six were donated by Nagaad staff members individually. In 2012, Nagaad expanded the application for scholarships to students beyond Hargeisa.

- *Link with NGOs to create the infrastructure for a women's political movement.*

Nagaad has held monthly coordination meetings and quarterly information sharing meetings as part of the project.

The above responses indicate that Nagaad has taken steps to implement the recommendations of the past evaluation. However, some of the steps are miniscule and more could have been done with them.

First, broadening focus beyond member organisations to all Somaliland women still appears to be limited. Nagaad reports that 31 of its members are based in Hargeisa while 15 are in the regions. If the majority of Somaliland women live in the rural areas, this picture displays urban-centrism that should be reversed with a higher presence in the regions. To ensure a greater presence in the regions, Nagaad should probably invest in mining region-based agencies to become members or work with its current members to diversify their presence. The pattern is probably determined by lack of power to determine where individual members work. This then brings into focus the establishment of regional offices. Granted, Nagaad has opened up the Erigavo office and intends to open others depending on the availability of funding. But funding will not automatically roll in unless there is an expansion plan with a strong justification. This in itself will depend on the success of the two existing regional offices which can be used to justify the expansion and become hubs for expanding the membership and harvesting greater outreach. In deed the project being evaluated provided Nagaad with an important entry into grassroots work which it should harness for the future. For a start, the two regional offices should be established as models for future offices and be used to enhance the exposure of the Hargeisa organisations to regional realities and work.

Second, the recommendation to move from implementing to advising and delegating more to member organizations should also be interpreted more liberally. This recommendation suggests a repository of technical information and materials that members can draw from. It also relates with the other recommendation of linking with other umbrellas and more coordination in distributing and producing materials as well as setting up a leadership institute to create a support-base for a women's political movement.

Third, Nagaad mentions mobilisation of young women to campaign for female candidates as a response to the recommendation to recruit more young people- especially girls - and give more support to youth associations. This is a limited interpretation of the recommendation as the step is a very time-bound activity while the recommendation is a long term strategy. This evaluation considers that Nagaad should have a specific programme focusing on the development of a successor generation of young women through various means including academic sponsorships, internships, mentoring and other forms of support. Similarly, there should be a clear strategy to involve men in advocacy. Certainly, this cannot be restricted to the fact Nagaad has men in its staff and Board of Directors. The recommendation is anchored on the need for a strategic partnership with men in the wider society to promote gender equality.

3.10 Lessons

The key lessons emerging from the project are analysed below.

Resistance

The project was about enhancing women's participation in politics and decision making. In the broader scheme of things, it was meant to increase women's empowerment and contribute to greater gender equality in Somaliland. This rested on changing attitudes and catalysing action in support of women's rights. Key pockets of resistance are embedded belief systems about women's positions. To counter this, the project targeted religious leaders and community elders for attitude change and acceptance of women's rights. As the results show, theoretical acceptance of women's rights does not translate into palpable action on their part. This means that sensitization alone does not create the required change and hence the need to think of additional approaches that would ensure conviction of those reached. For projects dealing with attitudinal change, it is critical to recognise the slowness to change and the pockets and tactics of resistance and hence have moderate expectations.

Operational Context

Although the project's impact on the local council elections cannot be measured in terms of successful women yet, one clear lesson is that political events not initiated by the project can provide useful impetus in favour of the project. In this case, the registration of more political parties created more choices for women aspiring for political office and is partly responsible for an increased number of women contesting the elections. In essence, such fortuitous events should be taken advantage of by the project. This means identifying strategic sites for entry and intervention. In the Somaliland context, the two fundamental sites are the political parties and the women contesting the elections. The project experienced challenges in working with political parties partly because of party priorities and partly because many of the parties are new and still trying to get established. But the parties are also heavily informed by cultural beliefs about women's position and hence are not taking any proactive steps to increase women's participation in their structures and processes except through stereotyped systems such as women's departments. As for the female candidates, there is a recognised need for technical, material and moral support. More fundamentally, there is need to deal with the clan as a stumbling block to women's ascension to political office, which the project tried to tackle through engagement with clan elders but with little success.

A second contextual issue was that of the physical environment. Obviously, the project was vulnerable to droughts and had to take remedial measures in some sites. The lesson from this is the need to do a thorough risk analysis to anticipate likely threats such as droughts and economic changes in order to build in a flexibility mechanism.

Implementation Strategy

The overall strategy used in the project was co-implementation through regional LNGOs. This was a change from the use of Women's Decision Making Forums. The key lesson learnt from

this approach are that: assigning co-implementers specific roles and sites minimises conflicts, duplication and competition; and use of multiple actors spreads capacity to more local actors and strengthens local civil society. But success of the approach depends on effective coordination, joint monitoring and regular reflections.

A second strategy was to involve a wide range of stakeholders (e.g. elders, religious leaders, government, LNGOs and beneficiaries). Some specific stakeholders were targeted because of their kind of influence in the society. While the project proceeded from the appreciation of the need for continuous dialogue and information sharing with such actors, it learnt that mass engagement without individualised responsibility is not effective. In this case, very many religious leaders and local elders attended sensitisation meetings but this did not translate into observable support for gender equality.

A third strategy was the use of literacy to empower women but also as entry points for awareness raising on women's rights. The lesson gleaned is that in deed personal empowerment, even through basic literacy, creates meaningful change in women's lives and has the potential for multiplier benefits to their families and communities. It opens ways for them to join structures and processes that require literacy. The inclusion of men in the literacy classes also helped in making the project not look discriminatory and enabled the men to appreciate the need for gender equality. While the classes were useful entry points for sensitisation, the expectation that the women would self-organise themselves to take collective action at the village level did not take off effectively and points to a lesson that the women should have been given more assistance towards this.

Related to the above was the expectation of communities to develop agenda for enrolling girls. As was established by the evaluation, these plans have not been committed to writing although the project reports training communities on producing such agenda. The lesson is that communities should have been actively facilitated to document their plans and made aware of the significance of this as a mark of organisation and an objective record and point of reference.

Planning

One of the project indicators was “number of female candidates reporting active support from elders and religious leaders”. There was no evidence that the project gathered any data on this indicator. To do this, the project required to have identified all the women contesting the elections and followed them up regularly to record whether they were receiving active support from elders and religious leaders. It should then have written reports on the number receiving the support and the kind of support being received. The indicator also required corroboration with the elders and religious leaders offering such support. Furthermore, it should have been clear what is meant by “active support”. The same issue applies to the indicator on “number of parties with gender policies”. A gender policy can be an elaborate separate document or be part of the mainstream party policy framework. The project plan did not specify what it meant or the ingredients expected of such a policy. The other indicator on number of advocacy initiatives was also recognised as placing emphasis on a measure that would not necessarily signify impact. The key lesson is that project indicators should be clear, meaningful and be refined over the duration of implementation.

The project listed “the number of women parliamentarians” as one goal-level indicator. This implies that it had anticipated that parliamentary elections would be held during the project lifespan, which was not the case and so it was not possible to measure this specific indicator. The project had also planned activities based on anticipated local council elections in April 2012 and had to revise its plans when the elections were postponed to November 2012. Measurement of the number of women in the public service was also constrained by lack of updated national statistics on the labour force. The lesson learnt is that indicators dependant on uncertain events should be avoided in planning but could be built into annual reviews should the events anticipated come up. The uncertainty should also be captured under risks and assumptions and a mitigation plan outlined.

Management of Expectations

The project learnt that carrying out a pre-project needs assessment ensures relevance and clear focus which assists with managing expectations beyond its mandate when they arise. This does not mean, however, that such expectations will not arise especially in situations where target communities are facing severe livelihood challenges as in Somaliland. The project appreciated that it cannot be oblivious to such realities and should, where possible, intervene, because survival needs can compromise project implementation and success. But this also points out the need during planning to build some emergency resources into the project to respond to humanitarian crisis especially when such crisis can be anticipated due to past trends.

At the same time, project success generates new expectations and demands. In this case, the literacy component has stimulated higher demand for literacy classes in other villages and higher skills among project beneficiaries. On the one hand, the project has no obligation to respond to these new demands considering that it had a clear time frame and focus. However, it is also an ethical issue in that such demands would not have arisen if the project did not enter the communities in the first place. The extra demands are therefore natural and legitimate. This again calls for identification of such eventualities at the planning stage and clarification on how they would be dealt with. Even if the project terminates at the end of its duration, this ethical consideration demands that it explores ways in which the gains made are not left to atrophy. This points out the need to link with primary actors that sustain the gains after project exit.

4.0 CONCLUSIONS

4.1 Project Goal

One key challenge to measuring the impact was that no parliamentary elections were held during the project’s lifespan to enable measurement of the number of Togdheer women in parliament. Another was lack of updated national level data on the labour force in order to measure the number of women in the public service. With that background in mind, it is concluded that the project has contributed to the goal of “enhancing gender equality in decision making in Togdheer Region”. This is based on the following parameters.

- a) Considering that some of the women contesting elections were beneficiaries of the project's literacy classes and awareness raising sessions, it is legitimate to partly attribute the increased number of female contestants to the project noting of course the increased number of political parties as a major external contributor. It is particularly notable that many of the candidates are young, have age on their side to gain experience in politics and are committed to continuing in politics even if they lose in the current elections. The short courses taken at Burao University also galvanised the beneficiaries to support the female contestants by campaigning for them. Respondents indicated increased awareness of women's rights, especially to participate in decision making and leadership. These trends portends well for the future if sustained.
- b) Increased democratization has opened up many opportunities for women to contest in elections.
- c) Information from Dalsan that 23 out of 45 elected members of the Central Committee are women is indicative that Somali women can actually ascend party structures without affirmative action.
- d) The case of the woman who now sits in the Guurti is significant because it shows that patriarchal structures founded on clan representation can actually be flexible and accommodate women even though she was a compromise candidate. It is a historical and ground-breaking happening that should be capitalized on as a precedent showing that women's participation in the higher echelons of politics is not an anathema.
- e) The high number and proportion of women in CECs can be directly attributed to the project as these structures were formed in target villages at the start of the project. However, a comparison with the baseline shows a slight regression from 50% to 48% in the proportion of women in CECs in 2009 and 2012. On the other hand, the proportion of women in VDCs is quite low (18%) although it constitutes an improvement from the baseline which had women at 10% in 2008. Cross-referencing from responses on the impact of the literacy component could be used to attribute this change to the eligibility of women for VDCs by virtue of their literacy. It is also notable that the highest position held by women in CECs is that of vice chair and that in VDCs is Finance Officer (read treasurer). At baseline, the highest woman in the VDCs was a member hence there is a slight positive change. The highest positions held by women indicate that men still have a stranglehold on the topmost leadership and that women tend to be compartmentalised to certain traditional positions.

The central constraint to gender equality and women's political participation is attitude born out of religious and cultural beliefs and structural dependence on the clan. There is also a clear pattern that women's leadership in the party structures is restricted to vice chairs and stereotyped to headship of the women's departments. This conforms to the glass ceiling phenomenon and compartmentalization of women to so-called women's issues.

4.2 Project Purpose

The purpose was “increased community acceptance of importance of women in decision-making at all levels of Togdheer Region”. The evaluation concludes that progress has been made towards this based on the parameters below but with the identified challenges to consider.

- a) The elders and religious leaders are certainly aware of the power they wield in communities. Their words about the ability to create change are very reassuring. However, they have not used their influence proactively and effectively. Although they cite lack of resources, this sounds unconvincing because they live within their communities and have ready platforms through their routine work.
- b) There was clear theoretical support for gender equality and women’s participation in politics and decision making by religious leaders and clan elders. However, few of them were clear-cut on practical steps they are taking to actualise this support. The lack of specificity from the elders and religious leaders points to a gap in project strategy. It appears that the forums for these cadres are held but without any clearly stipulated plans of action that the project could follow up on to quantify and verify the actions taken by the participants. This betrays a superficial satisfaction with merely holding forums (activity orientation) and not what they help to achieve (objective orientation). It is the considered opinion of the evaluator that without personal action plans that are implemented by the leaders and elders, the academic understanding and theoretical support will not achieve much. The fundamental question going forward then is: What are the alternative ways of utilising clan leaders and religious leaders other than discussion and awareness raising forums? And if the same approaches have to be used, what modifications do they require to ensure that they lead to palpable results?
- c) Religious leaders and elders are totally faithful to the reported dictates of religion on the glass ceiling for women. But it is disheartening to hear them stating this without any critical reflection even as they say that they support women’s participation in decision making structures. Female candidates did not report any significant support from elders and religious leaders. In fact, they often cited them as bottlenecks, especially with regard to the clan factor.
- d) Literacy has certainly helped in galvanising acceptance of women in decision making and providing entry points to structures and processes. There was also evidence that some women are taking collective action to address women’s rights. But while majority are agreed on social and economic rights, some have misgivings about political participation, which points out the need for further sensitisation of the women themselves. It appears that there was no concerted action by implementers to organise women so as to enable them take collective action and that women were left entirely on their own to figure out what to do.
- e) The clan factor is a major constraint to women’s political participation. But women are not letting it discourage them and are indeed coming out to contest. Political parties are not exactly doing anything to confront the issue and leave it to the individual candidates to manouvre around it. It does not look like any of the political parties has a serious gender policy. In fact, gender equality is still something remote in their priorities.

- f) The short courses had the greatest impact on the professional lives of the participants. Their greatest impact with regard to action to support women's rights was to galvanise them to support women contesting elections. But the courses appear to have had limited coverage of women's rights instruments beyond the constitution of Somaliland. There was no indication of coverage of international instruments relating to women's rights.

4.3 Project Results

Result 1: 7200 women and men in the 30 villages that participate in the literacy programs have the capacity to read and write.

- a) The project has significantly contributed to increasing levels of literacy and numeracy, especially among rural women, in the targeted villages, although the numerical target of 7,200 may not be reached. This has spurred further demand by former students for higher skills and vocational training. Among those asking for the classes are villages that were included in the needs assessment but were eventually not selected. Due to such demands, the implementers actually proceeded to adjacent villages after completing their initial allocations hence the larger coverage of 41 villages (30 was the target). This indicates that the literacy component made a big impression and has been very attractive.
- b) There is certainly willingness by villages to continue the literacy component. But willingness alone is not enough unless there are resources to back it up.
- c) None of the literacy centres visited had a written action plan to sustain the project. Respondents indicated that Somalis are generally oral and so the absence of written plans does not indicate lack of any plans. This might be so, but rationally speaking, a written plan is the most significant means of verification apart from observable implementation. Moreover, it is ironical that beneficiaries of a literacy project do not see the value of committing their plans to writing!
- d) All the classes were functional at the time of the evaluation.

Result 2. Men and women in the 30 villages that benefit from the literacy programs value the importance of girls' education.

Virtually all categories of respondents cited girls' education as improving in terms of enrolment at all levels including at university. They were also able to cite reasons why girls should be educated.

Result 3: Women, men and decision-makers of local communities have increased their knowledge about human rights, including gender equity.

There is increased awareness of human rights issues including gender equality. Respondents in all categories were able to identify why women's rights should be supported.

Result 4: Increased knowledge and skills of women who participate in decision-making in local councils, government institutions and community awareness (women leader) in Togdheer Region.

The courses attended by project beneficiaries were beneficial to them at personal and vocational levels. The beneficiaries were so motivated by the courses that they requested to improve their knowledge and skills in order to get diplomas and degrees. The courses also increased their commitment to women's rights and made them ready to support women seeking political posts.

Result 5: Local NGOs in Burao have increased capacity to advocate women's participation in decision-making.

- a) Activities around this result were not systematically organised by implementers who seemed to have taken it to mean attending the project coordination meetings rather than organising their own meetings for outreach. There was no categorical indication of the number of advocacy initiatives carried out by agencies during the project period. Apart from the coordination meetings and opportunistic linkages around specific events, there were no systematic linkages initiated by the implementers. As such, therefore, it is considered that not much was achieved here.
- b) The links with the Diaspora seem to have been left to the initiative of the implementers. Obviously, the majority of them do not have such linkages. There is also no indication that the project tried to stimulate such linkages using its profile as a collaborative venture that could have attracted the attention of the Diaspora better than initiatives by individual organisations.

Result 6: Acceptance of clan elders' for women to have access to decision-making positions.

Although there is an acceptance by clan leaders of women's participation in decision making, it is conditional on their restriction to certain levels. Some clan leaders are held back in their support for women's participation by fear of a backlash. The clan remains the main bottleneck to women's ascension to political leadership.

In summary, the final evaluation considers that the increased literacy and its impact on women, the appreciation of the value of girls' education, the increased knowledge about human rights and gender equality, benefits from the vocational courses and growing acceptance of women in decision making are positively building towards the realisation of the project purpose. However, more needs to be done on the result on increasing capacity of LNGOs to advocate women's participation with regard to the structured actions they are expected to take. Progress towards the goal is also evident in the increasing number of women contesting the local council elections, the pockets of support for them and the widening political space. However, attitude change remains a major challenge as is the clan enclave and negligible commitment by political parties.

4.4 External Environment

The main external factors that worked in favour of the project were: peace and political stability; registration of new political parties; revision of the minimum age to contest in local council elections from 35 to 25 years of age; and the free education policy. The main constraining factors were: rejection of the 25% quota which dampened the women's movement; postponement of local council elections; security concerns; recurrent droughts; and resistance to change.

4.5 Relevance

The project was very relevant and was well received by targeted beneficiaries. The major misgiving was related to its inability to respond to the practical livelihood needs of the communities. Main issues pointed out were: access to water and pasture during dry seasons; poor hygiene and sanitation in communities; and lack of maternity services for women.

4.6 Efficiency

Considering the funding against the geographical coverage, number of implementers, level of project resources, diversity of activities and number of beneficiaries, the project was quite efficient.

4.7 Sustainability

Communities have expressed willingness to continue with the literacy project. The level of willingness varies from place to place with some areas very confident. However, considering the levels of poverty and economic conditions in the country, it would be extremely difficult to continue without external funding.

4.8 Capacity Building

Both Nagaad and implementing agencies gained a lot of capacity in terms of resources, project management skills and collaboration and synergy.

4.9 Lessons

Resistance: Mass sensitization alone does not create the required change and hence the need to think of additional approaches that would ensure conviction of those reached. For projects dealing with attitudinal change, it is critical to recognise the slowness to change and the pockets and tactics of resistance and hence have moderate expectations.

Operational Context: Political events not initiated by the project provided useful impetus in favour of the project. But the clan remains a significant stumbling block.

Implementation Strategy: Co-implementation was effective and spread capacity to more local actors. But it depends on effective coordination, joint monitoring and regular reflections.

Involvement of a wide range of stakeholders is imperative but needs to be backed up with individualised or localised action plans.

Literacy was effective in empowering women and opened ways for them to join structures and processes that require literacy. The inclusion of men in the literacy classes also helped in making men appreciate the need for gender equality. However, the women should have been given more assistance towards mobilisation to take collective action at village level.

Communities need to be facilitated and supervised to document their plans and made aware of the significance of this as a mark of organisation and an objective record and point of reference.

Planning: Project indicators should be clear, meaningful and be refined over the duration of implementation.

Management of Expectations: Pre-project needs assessment ensures relevance and clear focus which assists with managing expectations. But practical expectations will arise especially in situations where target communities are facing severe livelihood challenges. Projects thus need to build in some emergency resources to respond to humanitarian crisis.